

# **PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF POPULATION WELFARE TRAINING INSTITUTES (PWTIs)**



**NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF POPULATION STUDIES  
APRIL 2008**

# **PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF POPULATION WELFARE TRAINING INSTITUTES (PWTIs)**

**AZRA AZIZ**



**NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF POPULATION STUDIES  
APRIL 2008**





# CONTENTS

Tables .....	v
Foreword.....	ix
Acknowledgement .....	xi
Executive Summary .....	xiii

## Chapter 1 INTRODUCTION

BACKGROUND .....	2
CURRENT SITUATION.....	4
PREVIOUS EVALUATIONS.....	5
OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY.....	6

## Chapter 2 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

SAMPLE DESIGN .....	7
QUESTIONNAIRES .....	9
DATA COLLECTION .....	10
Field Staff.....	10
Training of Field Staff .....	10
Field Work .....	10
Supervision .....	11
DATA ANALYSIS.....	11
SCHEDULE OF ACTIVITIES.....	11

## Chapter 3 SITUATION ANALYSIS

BUILDING .....	13
TEACHING AND OTHER FACILITIES.....	14
STAFF STRENGTH.....	15

## Chapter 4 PERCEPTIONS OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS

BACKGROUND CHARACTERISTICS.....	19
ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITIES .....	21
ANNUAL TRAINING PLAN.....	21
CONSULTATION CONCERNED DEPARTMENTS .....	22
ASSESSMENT OF FACULTY .....	22



ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES.....	22
ASSESSMENT OF FACILITIES AND LEVEL OF SATISFACTION.....	23
MONITORING AND SUPERVISION .....	24
PROBLEMS .....	24
Problem Identified by the Faculty of PWTI-Lahore.....	24
Problems Identified by the Faculty of PWTI-Karachi.....	25
SUGGESTIONS BY INSTRUCTORS OF PWTIs.....	25
RECOMMENTATIONS BY PRINCIPALS OF PWTIs .....	26
PWTI-Lahore .....	26
PWTI-Karachi.....	26

## **Chapter 5     PERCEPTIONS OF TRAINED PERSONNEL**

DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS.....	29
Gender.....	29
Age Pattern.....	30
Marital Status.....	30
Number of Living Children .....	30
Education .....	30
HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT .....	32
Title of Training Courses.....	33
EVALUATION OF TRAINING .....	33
The Extent of Learning .....	33
Learning from Training.....	37
The Best about Training.....	38
Training was not as Expected .....	41
Duplication/Repetition of Training.....	43
Part of Training to be Included or Excluded from the Contents.....	45
Effectiveness of Training.....	46
Orientation of Population Welfare Programme .....	48
Perceptions about Training Processes.....	48
Methodology of Training and Presentation of Lectures .....	49
Duration of Training and Number of Participants .....	49
Training Material and Audio-Visual Aids .....	51
Training Arrangements and Venue.....	52
Need for Additional Training.....	53
Suggestions by Trained Personnel for Better Performance of PWTIs .....	54

**Chapter 6 PERCEPTIONS OF TRAINED DRIVERS, NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS**

LEARNING FROM TRAINING .....	58
BENEFITS OF TRAINING .....	58
IMPACT OF TRAINING ON JOB AND PERSONAL LIFE .....	59
AREAS FOR FUTURE TRAINING.....	59

**Chapter 7 PERCEPTIONS OF CURRENT TRAINEES**

NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED .....	62
PERCEPTIONS ABOUT TRAINING .....	63
USEFULNESS OF THE TRAINING .....	64
PERCEPTIONS ABOUT FACILITIES .....	66
SUGGESTIONS .....	67

**Chapter 8 PERCEPTIONS OF DISTRICT POPULATION WELFARE OFFICERS**

SUGGESTIONS .....	71
-------------------	----

**Chapter 9 PERCEPTIONS OF PROVINCIAL DIRECTORS AND HIGHER OFFICERS**

INVOLVEMENT OF PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENTS IN THE PREPARATION OF ANNUAL TRAINING PLAN OF THE PWTI .....	75
TRAINING NEED ASSESSMENT BY PWDS FOR VARIOUS CADERS OF EMPLOYEES .....	77
NOMINATIONS CRITERIA FOR TRAINING OF PROVINCIAL EMPLOYEES .....	79
ASSESSMENT OF THE TRAINING PROGRAMMES OF PWTIs .....	80
THE LEVEL OF SATISFACTION OF FACILITIES .....	81
WEAKNESSES .....	82
SUGGESTIONS TO IMPROVE THE PERFORMANCE OF PWTIs .....	83
RECOMMENDATIONS .....	87
REFERENCE.....	88
PROJECT STAFF .....	89
ANNEXURE.....	90





## TABLES

TABLE 2.1: SAMPLE SIZE FOR THE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF PWTIs 2002-2005 .....	9
TABLE 3.1: SITUATION ANALYSIS OF BUILDINGS OF PWTI's 2006.....	14
TABLE 3.2: AVAILABILITY OF TEACHING STAFF AT PWTI's 2006.....	15
TABLE 3.3 : AUDIO-VISUAL AND OTHER FACILITIES AT PWTI's 2006.....	15
TABLE 3.4 : STAFF POSITION AT PWTIs AND THEIR BACKGROUND CHARACTERISTICS .....	17
TABLE 4.1: NUMBER OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS BY THEIR BACKGROUND CHARACTERISTICS .....	20
TABLE 4.2: NUMBER OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS BY DURATION OF TRAININGS RECEIVED .....	20
TABLE 4.3 NUMBER OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS BY THEIR LEVEL OF SATISFACTION .....	24
TABLE 5.1: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL WHO RECEIVED TRAINING(s) AT PWTI's BY DESIGNATION AND BY REGION .....	28
TABLE 5.2: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNAEL BY DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS ....	31
TABLE 5.3: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY CADRE AND BY NUMBER(s) OF TRAINING RECEIVED .....	32
TABLE 5.4: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES BY CADRE AND BY EXTENT OF LEARNING .....	35
TABLE 5.5: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF REASONS REPORTED TO SCORE 1-3 (NOT AT ALL, VERY LITTLE, LITTLE) FOR LEARNING FROM THE TRAINING(s) .....	36

TABLE 5.6: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF REASONS REPORTED TO SCORE 4-6 (TO SOME EXTENT, ADEQUATE, A LOT) FOR LEARNING FROM THE TRAINING(s).....	36
TABLE 5.7: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES BY REPORTED EXPLANATION OF LEARNING FROM TRAINING(s) (MULTIPLE RESPONSES) .....	37
TABLE 5.8: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY LIKENESS OF THE TRAINING(s) .....	40
TABLE 5.9: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF EXPECTATIONS FROM THE TRAINING(s) .....	42
TABLE 5.10: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES WHO THOUGHT THE TRAINING WAS DUPLICATION .....	44
TABLE 5.11: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES AND THE TITLES/TOPICS RECOMMENDED TO BE INCLUDED IN THE TRAINING(s) .....	45
TABLE 5.12: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES AND THE TITLES OF THE TRAININGS RECOMMENDED TO BE EXCLUDED FROM THE TRAINING(s) .....	46
TABLE 5.13: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ABOUT OBJECTIVES OF TRAINING(s), UNDERSTANDING OF THE SUBJECT(s) AND ENHANCEMENT OF ABILITIES .....	47
TABLE 5.14: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL REPORTED ABOUT THE TRAINING OF CURRENT POPULATION WELFARE PROGRAMME POLICY .....	48
TABLE 5.15: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING METHODOLOGY AND THE NUMBER OF TRAINING(s) RECEIVED .....	49
TABLE 5.16: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING DURATION AND CLASS STRENGTH AND BY NUMBER OF TRAINING(s) RECEIVED .....	50



TABLE 5.17: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING AIDS AND BY NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED .....	52
TABLE 5.18: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING ARRANGEMENTS AND VENUE AND BY NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED .....	53
TABLE 5.19: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON NEED FOR ADDITIONAL TRAININGS AND BY NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED .....	53
TABLE 5.20: SUGGESTIONS GIVEN BY THE TRAINED PROGRAMME PERSONNEL .....	54
TABLE 6.1: PERCENT DISTRIBUTION OF THE LEVEL OF EDUCATION OF DRIVERS, NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS .....	58
TABLE 6.2: RESPONSES OF DRIVERS, NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS ABOUT BENEFITS OF TRAININGS RECEIVED.....	59
TABLE 6.3: PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF DRIVERS, NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS BY THE EFFECTS OF TRAININGS ON JOB AND ON PERSONAL LIFE (MULTIPLE RESPONSES).....	60
TABLE 7.1: NUNBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND BY CADER.....	61
TABLE 7.2: PERCENTAGE OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND BYDESIGNATION .....	62
TABLE 7.3: NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI, CADER AND BY NUMBER OF TRAININGS PREVIOUSLY RECEIVED.....	62
TABLE 7.4: NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI ANDTHEIR VIEWS ABOUT TRAINING.....	64
TABLE 7.5: NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND THEIR VIEWS ABOUT USEFULNESS OF TRAININGS .....	65
TABLE 7.6: NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND THEIR VIEWS ABOUT FACILITIES DURING TRAINING .....	66



TABLE 7.7: NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND THEIR SUGGESTIONS FOR THE IMPROVEMENT OF PWTI's.....	67
TABLE 8.1: NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO HAVE EVER BEEN ASKED TO ASSESS THE TRAINING NEEDS OF THEIR STAFF .....	69
TABLE 8.2: NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO EVER ASSESSED THE TRAINING NEEDS OF THEIR STAFF AND COMMUNICATED TO THE MoPW .....	70
TABLE 8.3: NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO REPORTED THAT SUGGESTED TRAINING COURSES WERE ARRANGED.....	70
TABLE 8.4: NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO OBSERVED IMPROVEMENT IN THE PERFORMANCE OF TRAINED STAFF .....	71
TABLE 8.5: PERCENTAGE OF DPWOs WITH REPORTED AREAS OF TRAINING REQUIRED FOR THEIR STAFF (MULTIPLE RESPONSES).....	71
TABLE 8.6: PERCENTAGE OF DPWOs WITH SUGGESTED WAYS TO IMPROVE THE PERFORMANCE OF PWTIs.....	72

## FOREWORD

Non-clinical Training, imparted through the Population Welfare Training Institutes (PWTI) is one of the important components of Population Welfare Programme. Currently there are two PWTIs, one each working at Lahore which caters to the training needs of the Punjab and NWFP provinces and the other at Karachi, which meets the training requirements of Sindh and Balochistan provinces.

The present study is the second evaluation of the non-clinical training component undertaken by the National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS). The first study was undertaken in 2000. The Ministry of Population Welfare (MoPW) entrusted NIPS to evaluate the functioning of the training component. The major objectives of this study were to assess the performance, technical competency of the staff and effectiveness of the curricula besides situation analysis of the two institutes. This study has also gathered suggestions from the beneficiaries and officials directly involved in the training process at various levels.

The evaluation of the non-clinical training component was carried out by interviewing a sample of programme employees who received training from the PWTIs during 2002-2005, those who were under training during the currency of the evaluation of PWTIs and all the concerned officials of provincial Population Welfare Departments (PWD) involved in the process of formulation of training plan. The list of all programme personnel trained during 2002-2005 was obtained and used for taking a sample for this study. For drawing a sample for the study, the trained personnel during the reference period were grouped into three categories: the officers, supporting staff and service providers. A representative sample was drawn from each cadre separately.

The survey was conducted in 87 districts through structured questionnaires with combination of closed and open-ended questions. A sample of 158 trainees out of 867 trained by PWTI-Lahore and 207 trainees out of 1188 trained by PWTI-Karachi was selected.

The study provides detailed analysis of data collected from the field and highlights major problems in the process of conducting trainings and recommends

suggestions to improve the performance of the institutes. The views and perceptions of senior officials were recorded verbatim and presented in the report for the benefit of policy makers and planners.

We would like to gratefully thank all those individuals who contributed to this study by sharing their valuable experiences, perceptions and views. The management of PWTIs, who provided relevant record of trainees and other necessary information for the selection of sample and their assistance during the field, is gratefully acknowledged.

The coordinator deserves special thanks for efficiently and successfully completing the task of data collection and compilation. Dedication and hard work of the field interviewers in carrying out their assignment in field deserve special appreciation.

The author has produced a comprehensive report. At NIPS, we hope and expect that the policy makers and planners would find the data, findings and views presented in the study useful in devising and reviving the non-clinical training component and making their role more effective.

Sarod Lashari  
Executive Director



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS) under its research mandate evaluates various components of the Population Welfare Programme. The current study besides situation analysis of the Population Welfare Training Institutes (PWTIs) has also assessed the training activities and technical competency of the teaching staff and assessed and evaluated the effectiveness of the teaching materials.

A variety of samples were selected from various domains such as the in-charge of PWTI, teaching faculty of PWTI, various categories of trainees including trained programme personnel, current trainees and higher officers involved in the training process including DPWOs and provincial DGs.

Seven modules of questionnaires were designed for various categories of respondents. Four teams were engaged for collection of data from four provinces, AJK, Northern Areas and Islamabad. Fieldwork was completed during May to July 2006. The dedication and devotion of the teams during the fieldwork is appreciated.

Mr. Muhammad Anwar Iqbal, Coordinator of the project, supervised the initial preparatory work, and collected information from provincial DGs of NWFP and Balochistan. He also reviewed the final draft of the report. His services are duly acknowledged. All the field activities were managed and supervised by the Principal Investigator herself who also collected data from the two PWTI's and the provincial DG's of Punjab and Sindh.

Special thanks are due to the principals and the teaching faculty of PWTIs, DPWOs and other officials of Population Welfare Departments at tehsil, district and provincial levels who spared their precious time and provided us their valuable, honest and useful opinion and suggestions.

I acknowledge with gratitude, the support and advice provided by Mr. Mehboob Sultan, Director (R&S) NIPS, the Project Director of the study. Special thanks are due to both Mr. Mansoor ul Hussan Bhatti and Mr. Jehanzeb for reviewing the initial drafts of the report and providing input and suggestions.

The Secretary (M&F), NIPS deserves special thanks for providing administrative and financial support for timely completing the field activities. I am grateful to Mr. Faateh ud din Ahmed, Programmer NIPS for extending all kind of technical support whenever required especially computerizing and processing data and formatting the report. The services of Mr. Muhammad Arshad, data operator are also acknowledged. Last but not the least, I acknowledge the efforts of Mr. Imtiaz for typing the initial draft of the report.

Azra Aziz  
Senior Fellow  
Principal Investigator

## **Executive Summary**

The Training Component of the Ministry of Population Welfare (MoPW) is as old as the Population Welfare Programme (PWP) itself. Since the establishment in the training component of the MoPW, two types of training i.e. clinical and non-clinical are imparted through 12 Regional Training Institutes (RTIs) and two Population Welfare Training Institutes (PWTIs). The activity of clinical training aimed at building the capacity of working at the service delivery outlets of the MoPW, Ministry of Health (MoH), Provincial Line Departments, and other non-government and private sector organizations. Whereas the objectives of the non-clinical training are to supplement and support the training provided by RTIs. The major objectives of PWTIs are to provide knowledge and sharpen skills of the programme functionaries in management of programmed activities to meet the increasing demand of the programme.

This is the second evaluation of non-clinical training component undertaken by the National Institute of Population Studies (NIPS). The first study was conducted in 2000. Since then no evaluation study has been initiated. The major objectives of this study were to assess the performance, technical competency of the staff and effectiveness of the curricula besides situation analysis of the institutes. The suggestions were also obtained from the programme personnel and field officers involved in training process for improvement in existing curricula and future training programme.

The evaluation of the PWTIs was executed through carrying out a survey of the two PWTIs and samples of the current trainees, staff trained during 2002-2005 and all the concerned officials of provincial departments involved in the process of formulation of training plan.

A variety of samples from different domains were selected. Two principals of PWTIs, 8 instructors, 303 out of 365 selected trained programme personnel, 20 current trainees, 87 DPWOs, 18 out of 22 provincial officials including DGs selected were successfully interviewed to collect information. Reasons for non-response of 62 trained personnel and 4 provincial officials were transfers, promotions, leaves, being selected twice as they had attended more than one training courses.



The two PWTIs are situated in rented buildings, which neither appear nor fulfill the requirement of training institutes. The land for both the PWTIs has been acquired and it is required to expedite the construction work.

The existing teaching staff has basic qualification but strength of staff is insufficient to carry out annual training schedule given to PWTIs. Additional staff needs to be recruited at both the institutes.

Teaching facilities such as proper training hall, computers, scanners, multimedia, and computer programmer for assistance in teaching computer literacy are either inadequate or not available.

Comparative analysis of the audio-visual goods at both the PWTIs reveals that PWTI-Lahore has all the facilities whereas PWTI-Karachi does not have T.V. and VCR.

PWTI-Lahore has two vehicles that are in good working conditions while PWTI-Karachi has three vehicles but one is not in running condition. Among the teaching faculty, there are two Principals and 9 senior Instructors/Instructors, while one post of Instructor was vacant in PWTI-Karachi. All of them have postgraduate degrees but none of them has advanced training diploma/degree in the field of human resource development, demography or population.

All the staff of PWTI-Lahore has received on the job training whereas none of staff at PWTI-Karachi has received any type of training. Foreign training needs to be provided to the staff of both the institutes. The overall staff strength indicates that one post of assistant in PWTI-Lahore and one post of each instructor and Naib Qasid are vacant in PWTI-Karachi.

Teaching staff was enquired about their roles and responsibilities in developing training plan and conducting training activities. They were also enquired about their level of job satisfaction at PWTI, the problems if any and suggestions to improve the performance of the institutes.

All the respondents were well aware and expressed complete understanding of their role in Population Welfare Programme. They narrated their main responsibilities,

which included orienting the programme personnel with the objectives and missions of the Population Welfare Programme.

The respondents also explained that training plan was prepared by PWTIs in consultation with provincial PWDs and finally approved by the Federal Training Coordinating Committee (FTCC) of the MoPW.

The responses of most of the faculty members regarding their job satisfaction showed that all the staff was satisfied with their jobs whereas 4 of them were not satisfied with the performance of PWTIs. The reasons reported were under utilization of staff and instructors without teaching background.

Regular monitoring and supervisory visits by the Senior Officials from the MoPW were supportive in carrying out training activities of PWTIs.

Inadequate space at the institutes, shortage/non-availability of vehicles, nominations of non-deserving personnel, late submission of nominees/participants by the PWDs and repeated nominations were some of the problems identified by the faculty of PWTIs.

Need of own building, staff's foreign training, advance IT facilities, additional qualified staff etc. were some of the suggestions given by the principals of PWTIs to improve the performance of the Institutes.

Some of the suggestions made by the instructors and senior instructors included: good institutional/academic environment, foreign training, up gradation of the existing staff, creation of post of accountant to look after the accounts and retired personnel from PWDs to be invited as source persons. They also suggested that coordination and/or affiliation of PWTIs with other training and research institutes like NIPS, PIM etc. was important and would improve the institutional recognition.

For the purpose of this study trained personnel were grouped into three categories: the officers, supporting staff and service providers. A representative sample was drawn from each category separately. The information was collected regarding their background, the number of trainings received, the level of learning from each training



course, their perception and evaluation of the training received and suggestions to improve the existing curricula and overall training programmes of PWTIs.

It was observed that trainings were provided on eighteen different topics during 2002-2005. A review of the number of trainings received by various cadres of trainees revealed that each of the programme personnel had attended minimum of one training and maximum of four training courses. Overall 59 percent attended one training course, 31 percent attended two training courses, and 8 percent three and 2 percent attended 4 training courses. Out of total 303 trainees, 127 were officers, 48 supporting staff and 128 service providers. The analysis showed that officers were the major or principal resource developed by the non-clinical training. The titles of training courses attended by all the cadres matched with the various subjects related to their jobs.

The study observed a gender disparity among the beneficiaries of non-clinical trainings of both the institutes. Male participation was proportionately higher (61 percent) compared to females (39 percent). Age comparison of the trainees indicated that overall 57 percent trainees were below 40 years of age and 43 percent were 40 years and above. As regards marital status about 80 percent of the respondents were married while 20 percent were never married.

Cadre-wise analysis showed that among officers 15 percent, among supporting staff a fairly good percentage of 37 percent and among services providers 10 percent had more than 5 children. Although this percentage was quite high but lower than the highest number of children (which were seven) reported in previous studies.

Among the trainees 38 percent had Master level education, 20 percent BA/B.Sc. degrees and 17 percent had secondary/higher secondary education.

The reverse relationship was observed between number of training courses attended and scores on the level of learning. The more the number of training courses attended, the lesser the scores in learning i.e. 'little' or 'very little'. The study revealed that among all the trainees who received only one training course, 18 percent perceived level of learning as 'a lot', 45 percent perceived learning as 'adequately', 22 percent as 'to some extent', 14 percent as 'little or very little' while less than one percent perceived learning as 'not at all'.



Among all trainees, the extent of learning from the second training was 'a lot' 15 percent, 'adequate' 33 percent, 'to some extent' 32 percent, 'little' or very 'little' 20 percent, and 'not at all' 2 percent.

For the third training the percentage for learning 'a lot' was 14 percent, for 'adequate' 39 percent, 'to some extent' 36 percent, 'little' 4 percent, and 'very little' 7 percent.

In case of forth training, the percentage of learning 'a lot', 'adequate' was 25 percent each and 'to some extent' 50 percent. More details showing scores for officers, support staff and service providers have been reflected in Table 5.4.

A review of the data collected from both the institutes showed that about 94 percent respondents liked the training whereas 5 percent did not respond to this question and one percent did not like the training at all.

The trainees reported different reasons for the likeness of the training, such as 25 percent from PWTI-Karachi and 15 percent from PWTI-Lahore expressed that they liked the training arrangements, discipline, atmosphere, presentations, accommodation, methodology and environment of the training. About 14 percent from PWTI-Karachi and 9 percent from PWTI-Lahore reported that they liked the lectures delivered by the resource persons (retired personnel) of the MoPW. Almost 12 percent of the total participants (9 percent from PWTI-Karachi and 3 percent PWTI-Lahore) liked the close interaction among the participants/personnel drawn from all over Pakistan. They found it very pleasant occasion/event to interact with each other and share ideas about Population Welfare Programme and its policies. About 7 percent of the participants expressed their feelings that training was very much job related and therefore they liked it. Almost same percentage of the trainees liked the role-play and participatory approach of teaching used during the training. About 5 percent liked the lecture on Islam and Family Planning and the same percentage was found interested in lectures on mother and child health (MCH), reproductive health and contraceptive, the use of contraceptive methods to reduce population growth and information on diseases related to women.

The data collected on the perceived expectations of training courses exhibited that 7 percent of the personnel did not have any particular expectations from the training.

About 13 percent reported that training was according to their expectations. Computer learning was expected by 13 percent of the personnel, about 9 percent expected to learn about office management and procedures, office work, service rules etc.

When asked to tell if the training was according to their expectation/subject, about 8 percent replied that training was not up-to what they expected to learn, was totally irrelevant and nothing was related to their job. On the whole 31 percent personnel did not give relevant answer to this question. About 41 percent respondents mentioned various subject areas they expected to learn from the training they were nominated for.

It was surprising that 75 percent among all participants found one or the other topic repeated in all training courses, which lowered their interest. A review of the responses provided an insight of the contents, which needed to be included or modified. Training contents should be designed to meet the needs of employees and new challenges of time. It also showed that repeaters were sent to fill the number of participants, which should be avoided.

The list of topics to be included or excluded from the future training courses was also prepared on the bases of suggestions given by trained programme personnel.

About 89 percent of the trainees mentioned that they would recommend others to participate in a training since they thought the objectives of training were fully achieved, whereas 11 percent were of the view that little of the objectives were achieved and 2 percent did not recommend others to attend any training course because they thought the objectives were not achieved at all.

About 25 percent of the trainees personnel responded that their knowledge and understanding had fully improved after attending the training course while 64 percent said that their understanding improved to some extent and 11 percent said they gained very little.

It was interesting to know the extent to which the training was beneficial for the trainees. The responses showed their expressions as 9 percent very little, 63 percent to some extent and 26 percent of the respondents fully benefited from the training. Two



percent of the respondents found that the training did not help at all to enhance their capacity building and perform their duties well.

One major objective of PWTIs was to orient the programme personnel about the population policies launched since inception of the programme, specially the last introduced in the year 2002. In order to find out whether this objective was achieved, the respondents were asked whether they were taught about the programme policies or not. Only 9 per cent of the trainees did answer 'Yes' they were taught about the policy of Population Welfare Programme, 10 per cent reported that nothing was explained about the policies, around 81 percent of the programme personnel could not give relevant answer to this question and did not even know the current population policy.

This study also assessed the methodology, presentations, duration, class strength, training material, training aids, training arrangements and venue of training. The personnel who attended more than one training course were asked about their perception about each training course separately. The responses emerged very encouraging and most of the respondents were satisfied.

Almost 94 percent, 86 percent and 96 percent of the employees who already had attended one, two and three training courses respectively wished to attend additional training. Among the employees who attended 4 training, courses half of them were in favor to attend still more training courses while the rest half were not interested in more training.

Some of the suggestions given by trained personnel were:

- PWTIs should have own buildings.
- Resource persons should be well-qualified and subject specialists.
- Job related trainings should be arranged on regular basis, at least once or twice a year for all relevant categories of employees.
- TA/DA should be increased and paid in advance.
- Duration of each training should be at least two or three weeks.



- The number of participants for each training course should be reasonable to keep the interactive and comfortable atmosphere. Small groups would be more appropriate.
- The policy of "Right person for the right training course". should be implemented .Only relevant persons should be nominated for the training courses by the PWDs.

PWTI-Karachi arranged training programmes for Drivers, Naib Qasids and Chowkidars on introduction to family planning, manners, etiquettes, driving rules and maintenance of vehicles. Twenty persons among the trained personnel of this category were selected to get the feedback about the training course. It was interesting to note that all the respondents liked the training and found it very useful for their jobs as well as personnel life. They also suggested that such trainings should be continued for the benefit of other colleagues and the population programme as well.

At the time of survey, two training programmes were in progress at each PWTI. Training courses being conducted at PWTI-Lahore were: Basic Training for FWA and Geographical Management System while two training courses being conducted at PWTI-Karachi were: Motivation and Communication for Behavioral Change for FWA and Pre-service Training for the New Entrants.

Five participants from each of the 4 training courses were selected for interview. On-the-spot trainees were asked almost the same questions as were asked to the previously trained personnel.

Responding about the methodology used, majority of the trainees reported that both lecture oriented as well as participatory approaches were used. Ten participants were of the opinion that presentations were excellent; eight said they were very good and two rated good.

Overall presentation of lectures, organization of sessions and creating pleasant environment were reported as good by majority of the respondents. This showed the effectiveness and improvement in the performance of PWTIs. More than fifty percent of the respondents reported that duration of training was just right.

It is very encouraging to note that all participants of on-the-spot training reported that training provided by both the PWTIs was very relevant and useful for their jobs. Eighteen out of twenty trainees viewed that the training had explained the objectives and policies of Population Welfare Programme. Almost all of them expressed that they would recommend others to attend that type of trainings. Every body should have refresher knowledge to enhance the productivity.

About nineteen out of twenty trainees showed interest to have additional training from PWTI, which reflected the credibility of PWTIs and usefulness of the training courses being conducted.

The analysis showed that on the whole the personnel who received or were receiving training at the time of survey were more than satisfied from the performance of the PWTIs and wanted continuity of training programmes for the capacity building of the programme personnel.

Suggestions given by the on-the-spot trainees were:

- Officials/resource persons from provincial PWDs/DG office should be invited to deliver lectures at PWTI.
- Participants should be informed at least one week before the initiation of training. Refresher training for each officer at least once a year be arranged.
- Pre-service training should be arranged by PWTIs instead of NIPA.
- PWTIs should start training programmes on demography and population studies.
- More lectures should be arranged on population programme, its working, planning and targets.
- Trainers at PWTIs need further training/orientation to deliver good lectures.
- PWTIs should arrange visits to NIPA while the training is being conducted.

The survey was conducted in 87 districts. Districts Population Welfare Officers of the sampled districts were interviewed irrespective of the fact that they had attended any training course at PWTI or not. They were asked about their involvement in the process/formulation of non-clinical training. Specific questions raised were about: the



need assessment of the district's personnel required training courses for the staff; district's training needs communicated to the PWD/PWTI, and the improvement observed in the performance of trained personnel, if any.

Among all 87 DPWOs, 44 reported that they were asked for the need assessment of their employees whereas 43 DPWOs reported that they had never been asked for such assessments. As far as need assessed and brought to the notice of PWD or MoPW was concerned, 61 DPWOs stated that the need assessment was done and communicated to the higher level for implementation; 18 were from Punjab, 12 from Sindh, 21 from NWFP and 10 from Balochistan. The study showed that among 87 district officers, a total of 56 indicated that the training courses suggested by them were arranged whereas 31 reported that such training programme were not arranged.

About 77 officers out of 87 perceived that the training was helpful in improving the performance of their employees. They observed major difference between the functioning of trained and untrained employees. Among these 77 officers, 23 officers were from Punjab, 13 from Sindh, 23 from NWFP, 16 from Balochistan and 2 from AJK. Future training areas and general suggestions to improve the working of PWTIs and course contents are documented in the report.

Senior officials at each provincial PWD such as Director Generals, Secretaries, Deputy Secretaries, Directors and other higher officials involved in the human development processes of provincial employees were also approached to collect information regarding the training processes, nomination criteria, their perceptions about training courses, level of facilities at PWTIs, any weaknesses observed and suggestions to improve the training non-clinical training component of the programme.

In this regard twenty-two higher-level officials were contacted for interview from four provinces, 6 from Punjab, 5 from Sindh, 3 from Balochistan and 8 from NWFP respectively, while four officers from NWFP could not spare time due to other engagements. Therefore, 18 interviews were successfully completed. Their views and perceptions on subjects were recorded verbatim and presented in report for the benefit of planners.



# **CHAPTER 1**

## **INTRODUCTION**

Population Welfare Programme involves a complex process of behavioral change to bring about attitudinal change for adoption of small family norms. Since 1990, many population strategies had been formulated and implemented with the aim of reducing the population growth rate and fertility level. The programme has been able to raise contraceptive prevalence rate (CPR) in the country from 9.1 percent in 1984-85 (PCPS) to 11.8 in 1990-91 (PDHS), to 23.9 percent in 1996-97 (PFFPS) to 27.6 in 2000-01 (PRHFPS). Currently it is estimated about 32 percent. Similarly population growth rate and fertility level have considerably been reduced. However, success has not been to the extent as expected. Some of the main reasons are lack of continuity in the programme strategy and approaches, absence of political support, weak institutional capacity, and frequent changes in the administrative set-up.

One of the major flaws of the programme has been its inadequate information, education and communication, (IEC) strategy. Due to its ineffectiveness in convincing people for family planning and failure to help potential clients develop confidence in the safety, efficacy and acceptability of family planning methods. Furthermore, it has been noticed that the programme's IEC activities are directed towards the general public rather than targeting and motivating the specific audience groups. At the community level, there are inadequate supplies of IEC materials. At the programme level, the staff is not trained on IEC strategies and interpersonal communication (IPC) methods.

It warrants specialized knowledge, skills and understanding in carrying out the organization functions to achieve the goals and targets of the programme. Training component has been recognized as integral support activity to improve Programme efficiency through effective management. It has ever since contributed

to develop knowledge and enhance skills of the programme functionaries, enable them to carryout their duties with confidence, conviction and better understanding of the responsibilities.

## **BACKGROUND**

Current training component of the Ministry of Population Welfare has a history of passing through a series of institutional changes. Before the commencement of comprehensive Family Planning Scheme (1965-1970) there were two regional Training Cum Research Institutes (TCRIs) and one Medical Social Research Project (MESORP) in the country. These institutes were imparting training to new recruits and employees of the Health Department (Paramedics). Special courses were offered on adhoc basis with the support of the RTCRIs and the MESORP to provide training on new strategies of the Population Welfare Programme (PWP). These courses were mainly held for the then District Cum Publicity Officers and the doctors of Health Departments including District Health Officers (DHOs) and Medical Superintendents.

At a later stage TCRIs were converted into Regional Training Institutes (RTIs). They were primarily responsible to provide clinical training relating to family planning to new cadres of paramedics. The MESORP later evolved into the West Pakistan Research and Evaluation Center (WEPREC) was responsible for imparting training to field functionaries.

In 1970 a new Training, Research, and Evaluation Center (TREC) was created. As the name implies, training activities were one of the central components of this center. In 1978, the TREC was abolished and two Population Welfare Training Institutes (PWTIs) were established at Lahore and Karachi. In 1984 a third PWTI was established in Multan.

During 1993-1998 under government's rightsizing exercise, the institute at Multan was abolished and the functions of two PWTIs were reviewed. Since then these



institutes provide trainings on non-clinical subjects to supplement and support the clinical training provided by Regional Training Institutes (RTIs) of MoPW.

During the Seventh Five Year Plan period (1988-1993) specific strategies were introduced to improve the quality of training, widen its scope and strengthen the entire training system.

During Eighth Five Year Plan period (1993-1998), professional skills and knowledge of programme personnel and employees of other nation building departments (NBDs) were improved through training/orientation. The training during this period enhanced and up-dated the knowledge of programme personnel improved their motivational skills and provided them the opportunity to share knowledge and experience with one another during the training programmes. Employees of NBDs and community-based groups (CBGs) from different walks of life were sensitized on population issues and as a result, they availed service facilities of the programme. The training, however, faced some constraints and the quality of training was adversely affected.

Later on more emphasis was given to strengthen the district level management, which was aligned to the devolution process. In that process the role of field functionaries acquired importance and a need was felt to identify those officials whose training would contribute towards improvement in programme performance. After devolution the role of MoPW was revamped. Apart from providing FP/RH services, emphasis was given on advocating the programme in the community.

Resource support and expertise from NIPA, Punjab University and Karachi University was engaged for training. Specialized trainings were outsourced to reputed institutions like NIPA and PIM to improve skills of programme managers.

During the Ninth Five Year Plan (1998-2003), the Programme focused on three issues i.e. effective management, demand creation and effective delivery system. For the organization of the non-clinical training, as for any other component of the PWP, these



issues provided a guideline. Consequently the objectives and strategy of non-clinical training were defined and training was organized accordingly.

## CURRENT SITUATION

The objectives and mandate of non-clinical training as defined in the PC-1 (2003-2008) are the same as were in 1998-2003.

The **functions of PWTIs** are:

“To provide training for the Programme Functionaries; employees of other Nation Building Departments; Community Based Groups; NGOs and TGIs etc. At the same time Master Trainers are developed to carry out training at local levels”.

However, during 2003-2008, more emphases is to be given to the cross cutting effect of population and development and emphasis on the role to be played by all stakeholders and community based groups for mainstreaming the small family norms in the society would be given due attention in training activities.

The annual training plans for three-years (2002-2005) developed by the PWTIs Lahore and Karachi are given in Annexure (Table 1-4) along with number of trainees in each type of training. Review of the training plans and course contents reveal that both the training institutes have their own training agenda and contents of the course according to the need of the trainees. In any case, the over all role of PWTIs is human resource development of Population Welfare Programme to build the capacity of workforce for achieving the goals of the programme.

The PWTIs are supposed to deliver non-clinical training to programme personnel, employees of other nation-building departments target group institutions, community based groups and organized sector. Programme personnel include officers and other employees of the Programme.

The Directorate of Training in the Ministry has been playing a leading role to guide, co-ordinate, monitor and review the training programme to ensure optimal

utilization of PWTIs, uniformity in the training courses, and proper utilization of resources as planned.

Federal Training Coordinating Committee (FTCC) headed by Secretary, MoPW meets once a year to review, update and finalize annual training requirement and approve Annual Training Plan. The Committee comprising of DG (P), DG (T), Dir (P), Secretaries of provincial Population Welfare Departments, Chief (P& SP), P&D Division & Health Division (National Coordinator of LHWs) and Representatives from NIPA and NGO Sector.

## PREVIOUS EVALUATIONS

The following studies were previously conducted for the evaluation of PWTIs:

1. Review of Population Welfare Training Institute, Karachi in 1995 by NIPA Karachi (Ahmad 1995) aiming to look at the functions and infrastructure of the PWTI Karachi.
2. Evaluation of Non-clinical Training Component of Population Welfare Programme in 2000 by NIPS (Sheraz. Ayesha 2000). Objectives of the study were:
  - ♣ To assess the strength of PWTIs regarding information and manpower
  - ♣ To scrutinize the level of knowledge and training received by the staff of the PWD and officials of Nation Building Departments at PWTIs
  - ♣ To assess the impact of training provided at the PWTIs
  - ♣ To assess the extent to which the trained staff utilize the acquired knowledge and skills in their job.
  - ♣ To identify major problems faced by the trainees and suggest recommendations for improvement in the training.
3. Evaluation of Population Welfare Training Institutes by Population Council (Katzan, Julia Taslima and Siddiqi, Khalil 2000) to build a model and provide recommendations regarding immediate, midterm and long-term actions. The study aimed to achieve the following objectives:

- ♣ To gain more specific knowledge of the MoPW and their needs regarding non-client training
- ♣ To evaluate the functioning of the PWTIs against their mandate and the model
- ♣ To design a model which could fulfill the needs of MoPW
- ♣ To formulate a strategy and recommendations for better functioning of the PWTIs to meet the needs of the Ministry

Curriculum is the main component to be assessed and analyzed in evaluating the training institutes. All previous studies have not taken this component into consideration. A curriculum of PWTIs which has regularly been revised according to new dimensions need to be taken into consideration in evaluating this component. There is an urgent need to change the curricula according to change in the needs of Population Welfare Programme.

Since 2000 to date no evaluation of the PWTIs has been conducted, while a considerable proportion of the budget is being spent on it. Realizing the need for evaluation of the non-clinical component of the Programme, the Ministry suggested that NIPS should undertake the study so that performance of PWTIs could be assessed on scientific bases. Accordingly the present study was conducted with the aim to assess the performance of PWTIs for the last three years i.e. 2002-2005, evaluate and analyze the opinions of trainees about training they attended during the said period.

## **OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY**

The present study has following main objectives:

1. To conduct situation analysis of the PWTIs at Lahore and Karachi.
2. To assess training activities and technical competency of the staff of PWTIs.
3. To evaluate and analyze the opinions of trainees about training courses launched by both the institutes.



## CHAPTER 2

### RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The study is evolved to evaluate the non-clinical training component and training activities carried out by PWTIs.

The evaluation of the PWTIs has been executed through carrying out a survey of the two PWTIs and sample survey of the current trainees, those trained during 2002-2005 and all the concerned staff of provincial departments involved in the process of formulation of training plan.

The study looked into the required details of each PWTI for con-clinical training. Accrued data and information about each mode of in-service training entailed a situation analysis. Once the situation analysis of each PWTI was separately carried out, the findings were juxtaposed in their totality, and effectiveness of the training was evaluated.

#### SAMPLE DESIGN

Keeping in view the multiple focus of the study, it was decided to draw a variety of samples from the following domains: -

- 1 In-charge of PWTI (Principal)
- 2 Teaching faculty of PWTIs
  - ♣ Senior Instructors
  - ♣ Instructors
- 3 Various categories of trainees
  - ♣ Trained Programme Personnel
  - ♣ Current Trainees
- 4 Officers involved in the Training Process
  - ♣ DPWOs
  - ♣ Provincial DGs

The sanctioned strength of two PWTIs includes one Principal, two Senior Instructors and 5 Instructors. Recognizing the pivotal role of the PWTIs in non-clinical

training component of PWP and the numerically small size of their teaching faculty, cent percent sample of PWTIs and teaching faculty was drawn.

For the sample size of the Programme Personnel trained during 2002-2005, the listing of trainees in each type of training for the years 2002-2003, 2003-2004 and 2004-2005 were collected from each PWTI and stratified samples were drawn.

According to annual training schedule for the PWTI-Karachi, six types of trainings for the year 2002-2003, ten types of trainings for the year 2003-2004 and sixteen types of trainings for the year 2004-2005 were conducted.

PWTI-Lahore had conducted fourteen, thirteen and twenty types of trainings during the years 2002-2003, 2003-2004 and 2004-2005 respectively.

In order to draw sample the participants who attended in-house training programme from 2002-2005 were divided into three categories i.e. officers, supporting staff and service providers. All the training programmes conducted during the same period were grouped into two; Technical and Managerial Training.

On the spot trainees from each PWTI were also selected for interview.

District Population Welfare Officers of all the selected districts were included in the sample irrespective of whether they received any training or not. Provincial Directors and all senior officers involved in the process of training were selected in the sample.

Detailed sample of trainees is given at annexure Table 1-4 and summary is shown in Table 2.1 below. The districts visited during the survey are given at annexure Table 5.

**TABLE 2.1**  
**SAMPLE SIZE FOR THE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF**  
**PWTIs 2002-2005**

	Total Sample Size	Total	Sample
1	Principal, PWTI	2	2
2	Sr. Instructor	4	4
3	Instructor	10	10
4	Programme Personnel trained by: PWTI-Lahore (18% of 867) PWTI-Karachi (17% of 1188)	867 1188	158 207
5	Present Trainees at PWTI (10 at each PWTI)	20	20
6	DPWOs of all Districts	87	87
7	Provincial DGs and other concerned officers	22	22
Total		2200	510

## QUESTIONNAIRES

For the collection of data, the technique of structured questionnaire and interview was applied. All respondents in the same category were asked the same set of questions. Seven modules of questionnaires were developed for various categories of respondents:

1. Module for Principals of PWTIs
2. Module for teaching faculty at PWTIs
3. Module for trainees of PWTIs during 2002-2005
4. Module for Drivers, Naib Quasids and Chowkidars trained during 2002-2005
5. Module for on-the-spot trainees
6. Module for District Population Welfare Officers
7. Module for Provincial DGs and other officers involved in the formulation of Training Plan

It was intended to determine whether the training was effective in terms of quality education, enrolment, output, strength of staff, academic qualifications of training staff, experience of staff observance of actual curriculum, qualifications of trainers, availability of audiovisual equipment and the extent of learning from the training etc.



## DATA COLLECTION

### Field Staff

Four teams were formed, one each for Punjab, Sindh, NWFP and Balochistan for the collection of data from the field. Each team was composed of two persons (males). The team that worked in NWFP also covered AJK. Each team was supervised and monitored by the Principal Investigator. Total Project staff included:

1	Principal Investigator	1
2	Project Coordinator	1
3	Data Manager/Programmer	1
4	Office Coordinator	1
5	Field Investigators	8
6	Typist/Key Punch Operator	1

### Training of Field Staff

A ten-day training programme was conducted for the field investigators. Which did two day pre-testing of questionnaires in nearby district follow.

Topics covered in training were: -

- i) Purpose of the survey
- ii) Outline of survey plan
- iii) Explanation and discussion of questionnaires
- iv) Discussion on coding plan
- v) Demonstration interviews
- vi) Discussion on possible problems and their solution

### Field Work

Field staff carried out fieldwork for about one and a half month during June and July 2006. A total of eighty seven districts were visited which include 40 districts of Punjab, 20 districts of NWFP (including AJK), 17 districts of Sindh and 21 districts of Balochistan. Three days were secured for interviews of trainees in each district and two days for situation analysis and interviews of higher officials of each province.

Situation analysis of each PWTI and interviews of Principals, Senior Instructors/Instructors and Provincial DGs and concerned officers were carried out by the Principal Investigator and Coordinator of the Project.

### **Supervision**

Adequate arrangements were made for supervision of data collection to ensure quality of data. All the relevant questionnaires were checked before leaving the concerned district.

### **DATA ANALYSIS**

Once the survey completed, the questionnaires were checked and edited by the Field Coordinator whereas the Key Punch Operator entered the data using the FoxPro package. The programmer carried out data processing and in-depth analysis using the software SPSS 13.0.

### **SCHEDULE OF ACTIVITIES**

Time schedule of project activities was as under:

S.No	Activities	Time Schedule
1	Preparation of Project Proposal	January 2006
2	Developing of Questionnaires	January-March 2006
3	Meeting of Technical Advisory Committee (TAC)	March 2006
4	Selection of Staff	April 2006
5	Training of Field Staff and Pre-testing	May 2006
6	Data Collection	June - July 2006
7	Data Entry and Data Editing	August - October 2006
8	Data Analysis	November - December 2006
9	Draft Report	January - March 2007
10	Final Report	April - May 2007
11	Dissemination/Seminar	June 2007





## **CHAPTER 3**

### **SITUATION ANALYSIS**

Currently two PWTIs situated in Lahore and Karachi cater for the need of non-clinical training of programme personnel of the Population Welfare Programme. The situation analysis of the PWTIs presents physical structure, availability of the facilities in the premises/buildings, teaching staff, audio-visual aids, vehicles, lodging arrangements and other facilities.

#### **BUILDING**

PWTI-Lahore was established in 1962 and PWTI-Karachi in 1982 (Table 3.1). The PWTI-Lahore is situated in a rented private building/commercial plaza in one of the main shopping areas of Lahore while the PWTI-Karachi is functioning in the main Secretariat building of the provincial government at Karachi. Each building has 9 or 10 rooms, which are mostly used for the offices of Principal, teaching staff and administration staff. Both the buildings do not adequately fulfill the essential requirement of the training institutes. PWTI-Karachi has training hall having lecture facility while in Lahore makeshift arrangements have been made to house facilities like lecture room and library. None of the two has proper facilities for conducting training sessions or group discussions. Therefore, most of the trainings with large number of trainees are organized in hotels.

An exclusive training hall having lecture facility is available in one institute only, while the overall training environment at both the institutes is not conducive to conduct trainings in peaceful environment. Above all, one institute has no library while both the institutes don't have their own hostels to accommodate trainees.

**TABLE 3.1**  
**SITUATION ANALYSIS OF BUILDINGS OF PWTIs 2006**

S.No.	Building	PWTI-Lahore	PWTI-Karachi
1	Establishment	1962	1982
2	Type of building	Rented	Secretariat Building
3	Number of rooms	9	10
4	Number of rooms devoted for training/lecture	0	1
5	Building is suitable for training	No	No

## TEACHING AND OTHER FACILITIES

The assessment of availability of qualified teaching staff and related facilities as reflected in Table 3.2 and Table 3.3 indicate that both the institutes have qualified teaching staff whereas some other necessary facilities like proper training hall, programmer for teaching computer literacy, computers/computer lab, scanners and the supporting staff etc. are either inadequate or not available. Both the institutes need additional staff to be recruited since the existing teaching staff is not enough for providing training. PWTI-Lahore demanded one Senior Instructor, 2 Instructors and one Computer Programmer, whereas PWTI-Karachi required 3 Instructors, one Assistant, one Computer Operator, besides each Electrician, Storekeeper, Sweeper, Driver and Mali respectively.

The inventory of durable goods indicates that each PWTI is equipped with furniture, teaching aids and audio-visual equipment. A comparative analysis of the audio-visual and other facilities at both the PWTIs reveals that PWTI-Lahore has all facilities except gas and library, whereas PWTI-Karachi does not have the basic necessity of audio visual aids like TV and VCR. None of the PWTIs has hostel accommodation. Consequently the hotel and transportation charges paid to the trainees consume bulk of the financial allocation of the activity.

Both the PWTIs have vehicles. PWTI-Lahore has two vehicles in good working condition while PWTI-Karachi has three vehicles but one is not in working condition.



**TABLE 3.2**  
**AVAILABILITY OF TEACHING STAFF AT PWTIs 2006**

S.No	Availability of Teaching staff	PWT1-Lahore	PWT1-Karachi
1	Qualified teaching staff	Yes	Yes
2	Teaching staff adequate for providing training	No	No
3	Staff Required	Senior Instructor, Instructor, Computer Programmer	Instructor, Assistant, Computer Operator, Electrician, Store Keeper, Sweeper, Driver, and Mali

**TABLE 3.3**  
**AUDIO-VISUAL AND OTHER FACILITIES AT PWTIs 2006**

S.No	Facilities	PWT1-Lahore	PWT1-Karachi
1	Audio-visual	Yes	Yes
2	Type of audio visual		
	Computer	Yes	Yes
	Multimedia	Yes	Yes
	Screen	Yes	Yes
	Over head projector	Yes	Yes
	Camera	Yes	Yes
	Slide projector	Yes	Yes
	TV	Yes	No
	VCR	Yes	No
3	Other facilities:		
	Electricity	Yes	Yes
	Gas	No	Yes
	Piped running water	Yes	Yes
	Working toilet	Yes	Yes
	Committee room	Yes	Yes
	Library	No	Yes
	Furniture	Yes	Yes
	Hostel Accommodation	No	No
4	Vehicle	2 (all working)	3 (2 working)

### STAFF STRENGTH

The staff strength of each PWTI appears like a pyramid. The number of employees at the base is large, moderate at the middle and lowest at the pinnacle. The positions at the base constitute the auxiliary and support staff. The critical staff is at the



middle, while the management occupied the apex. With this structure, the institute is heavily dependent upon the performance of its staff at the middle of the pyramid.

Table 3.4 shows the total sanctioned staff strength of 40 personnel, 19 in PWTI-Lahore and 21 in PWTI-Karachi, there are incumbents against 37 positions in both the PWTI's. While 3 positions i.e. one in PWTI-Lahore and two in PWTI-Karachi are lying vacant. The vacant positions include one post of an Assistant in PWTI-Lahore and one instructor and Chowkidar each in PWTI-Karachi. The position of Artist is sanctioned and occupied at PWTI-Lahore but this post has been abolished at PWTI-Karachi. Similarly the position of Library Assistant is sanctioned and filled at PWTI-Karachi but it has been abolished at PWTI-Lahore.

The table also presents background qualification and training record of the staff. All the top-level management at both the PWTI's is highly qualified. All these have postgraduate degrees but none of the respondents has advance-training diploma/degree in the field of human resource development or demography. Another stunning fact is that all the faculty staff at PWTI-Lahore has received on-the-job training whereas none from the PWTI-Karachi has received any such training.

TABLE 3.4

## STAFF POSITION AT PWTIs AND THEIR BACKGROUND CHARACTERISTICS

Cadre		PWTI – Lahore					PWTI - Karachi				
		BPS	Sanctioned	In position	Education	Training Received	BPS	Sanctioned	In position	Education	Training Received
1	Principal	19	1	1	MA	Yes	19	1	1	MA	No
2	Sr. Insturctor	18	2	2	MA	Yes	18	2	2	MA	No
3	Instructor	17	3	3	MA	Yes	17	3	2	MA	No
4	Admin Officer	16	1	1	BA	Yes	16	1	1	MA	No
5	Artist	16	1	1	Diploma	No	0	0	0	0	0
6	Audio-Visual Officer	0	0	0	0	No	0	0	0	0	0
7	Stenographer/ Typist	12	2	2	FA	No	12	3	3	FA	No
8	Assistant/Acc.	0	1	0	0	Yes	11	1	1	FA	No
9	Lib. Assistant	0	0	0	0	0	11	1	1	MA	No
10	Projectionist	12	1	1	Matric	Yes	12	1	1		
11	L.D.C.	5	1	1	Matric	Yes	5	1	1		
12	Driver	5	2	2	Matric	Yes	5	2	2		
13	Naib Qasid	1	3	3	Primary	Yes	1	3	3		
14	Chowkidar	1	1	1	Primary	Yes	1	2	1		





## **CHAPTER 4**

### **PERCEPTIONS OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS**

This chapter presents the background characteristics, role, responsibilities and perceptions of Principals and faculty about the functioning of PWTIs. The faculty at PWTIs includes a Principal, Senior Instructors and Instructors. The Principal is the head of the institute. The major responsibilities of the Principal are preparation of PC-1, annual training plan, annual training schedule, execution of training activities, preparation of working papers and undertaking of research activities. He also shares teaching assignments with Senior Instructors and Instructors.

Out of 10 Senior Instructors and Instructors posted at these institutions, 8 were available for interview while remaining 2 were on leave. This chapter presents the analysis of responses from 2 Principals, 2 Senior Instructors and 6 Instructors who were interviewed.

### **BACKGROUND CHARACTERISTICS**

The background characteristics of the staff at the institutes are presented in Table 4.1. The data show that both the Principals have Master level education; one at PWTI-Lahore is male whereas the other at PWTI-Karachi is a female. Similarly the Senior Instructors at both the PWTIs are males having Master degrees and short courses at their credit.

Among the Instructors at PWTI-Lahore, 2 are females and one is male, whereas at PWTI-Karachi one is female and 2 are males. All instructors have Master degrees. However, none of the teaching staff in the two institutes has degree in the relevant social science subjects like population, demography, anthropology or human resource development etc.

TABLE 4.1

**NUMBER OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS BY THEIR BACKGROUND CHARACTERISTICS**

	Sex		Education	Received Training			
				In Country		Foreign Training	
	Male	Female	M.A.	Yes	No	Yes	No
<b>Principals</b>	1	1	2	2	0	0	0
<b>Senior Instructors</b>	2	0	2	2	0	1	1
<b>Instructors</b>	3	3	6	5	1	1	5
<b>Total</b>	6	4	10	9	1	2	6

The detail of various trainings received by Principals and Instructors are presented in Table 4.2. They have attended courses in the discipline of demography, teaching methodology, computer, management, communication, reproductive health and advocacy organized by NIPA, Aga Khan University, John Hopkins University, Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences (PIMS) Islamabad and Pakistan Institute of Management (PIM), Lahore. The maximum duration of training courses attended by two teaching staff is 40 days (pre-services) and minimum of ten days attended by three respondents from Pakistan Institute of Management Sciences.

None of the staff had attended advance-training courses in Population and demography in Pakistan or abroad. However, the respondents were satisfied with their training and perceived it benefits in the performance of their professional responsibilities.

TABLE 4.2

**NUMBER OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS BY DURATION OF TRAINING(s) RECEIVED**

	Duration (Number of Days)				Number
	01-10	11-20	21-40	Venue	
<b>Principal</b>	1	0	0	-PIMS-Lahore and Karachi	1
<b>Senior Instructor</b>	0	1	0	-John Hopkin University	1
<b>Instructors</b>	2	2	2	-NIPA-Karachi -Agha Khan University -PIMS-Lahore and Karachi	6



## ROLE AND RESPONSIBILITIES

The Principals and Instructors of both the institutes have expressed complete understanding of their role in Population Welfare Programme. They expressed that their main responsibilities are to provide orientation to the programme personnel in the objectives and mission of the Programme and impart them non-clinical training. The specific roles defined by the faculty members are as under: -

1. To plan and conduct training on different topics for employees of Ministry of Population Welfare and provincial departments.
2. To develop course objectives, contents and relevant material.
3. Preparation of training schedule.
4. To contact resource persons, correspond with the participants and arrange training logistics.
5. To deliver lectures.
6. To prepare/deliver lectures if resource person(s) is/are not available.
7. To conduct discussion sessions on different areas for different categories of personnel.
8. To facilitate participants and work as DDO.
9. To develop the curricula for various training programmes.
10. To prepare report as a special assignment, work as member/chairman of purchase committee.
11. To arrange step down training as per target of FWA, FWW, LHW, TPWO, DPWO and Religious Leaders.
12. To arrange short-term training.
13. To write article(s) in "Abadi Nama".

## ANNUAL TRAINING PLAN

According to respondents Annual Training Plan is developed jointly by following the specific procedure. After having need assessment from the provincial departments (where employees need training) the faculty and Principal develop the Annual Training Plan and various activities to be undertaken during the year. The concerned faculty member designs the details of each activity/training. Draft plan is presented in FTCC meeting for discussion and necessary changes are made if required before approval of Annual Training Plan is accorded.



## **CONSULTATION WITH CONCERNED DEPARTMENTS**

As regards the need assessment of the employees and consultation with the nominating agencies/departments, the faculty ensures full involvement and consultation of the concerned agencies/departments. Their suggestions and comments are fully incorporated in designing the training plan.

According to respondents, the following factors are considered while designing the Annual Training Plan:

- ♣ Goals and targets set by the MoPW
- ♣ New recruitments in the provinces
- ♣ Deficiencies in knowledge and skills
- ♣ Training activities are redesigned or modified according to the changes/ground situation (financial, management, computer)
- ♣ Budget allocation

## **ASSESSMENT OF FACULTY**

Once the training plan is approved, the training activities are divided among the faculty according to their academic background, interest, aptitude and availability.

The performance of faculty is frequently assessed and this assessment is undertaken on the criteria based on how effective the course contents are designed, how well faculty coordinate and supervise the course activities and how well they write report on their training course.

## **ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES**

Assessment of training programme and trainees is an important tool for redesigning and reshaping future training activities. For that a number of strategies are used in the process of assessment. Daily recap, role playing exercises, brain storming sessions, level of participation during training and evaluation report prepared at the end of training are worth mentioning steps taken to assess and evaluate any training course and the trainees.

## ASSESSMENT OF FACILITIES AND LEVEL OF SATISFACTION

Since an insight into perception of staff, at a given institution, about the work facilities within the organization provides evidence on their satisfaction levels, the study attempted to look into the perceptions of staff at PWTIs. A specific question was raised “Does the Institute have all the facilities that a good training institute should have?”. The responses from the Principals and faculties are given in Table 4.3. Except one Senior Instructor, all faculty members and Principals in the two PWTIs perceived that the institutes lack many facilities that a good institute should have.

The employees’ job satisfaction is extremely important in assessing the credibility of any institute. The responses of Principals and faculty are shown in Table 4.3. All the faculty of the two PWTIs is satisfied with their jobs, where 6 out of 10 are not satisfied with the performance of PWTIs. Since on the one side the instructors are under utilized and on the other because of the fact that most of the instructors even do not have teaching background. These institutes also lack teaching aids i.e. computers, multimedia, computer printer etc. Job descriptions are not well defined. Faculty members are rarely sent for training in country or abroad. There is unnecessary delay in the release of funds by the AGPR, which is a great hindrance in organizing training programmes. It is suggested that there is no need of AGPR. Yearly budget should be given to the institutes to carry out training activities as per schedule of Training Plan.

It is interesting to note that the Principals of both the institutes are fully motivated to enhance the performance level of the institutes. They appear very ambitious to develop and improve the institutes compatible with other training institutes of national and international repute. They expressed their dissatisfaction about the standard of the institutes.



TABLE 4.3

## NUMBER OF PRINCIPALS AND INSTRUCTORS BY THEIR LEVEL OF SATISFACTION

	Does Institute has all the facilities		Are you satisfied with the job		Are you satisfied with the performance of PWTI		Total
	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	
Principals	0	2	2	0	0	2	2
Senior Instructors	1	1	2	0	1	1	2
Instructors	0	6	6	0	5	1	6

## MONITORING AND SUPERVISION

The Principals were asked few questions to inquire about the existing monitoring system of the trainings. The respondents reported that senior officials of MoPW pay usual visits to the institutes to check the training activities and solve the problems of the institute if any. They are also invited at the opening and closing sessions of the training programmes. They directly get feedback from the participants by discussing the training activities. Usually, the Secretary, Additional Secretary, Joint secretary, DG (P), Director Training, Federal Minister for Population Welfare, Provincial Ministers, Secretary and Directors also make supervisory visits to the PWTIs.

## PROBLEMS

The staffs of both the institutes were asked about the major hindrances in conducting useful training programme. The problems identified are as under:

**Problems identified by the Faculty of PWTI-Lahore**

1. Provincial Department does not send nominations as per requirement and mostly repeaters are sent.
2. Neither nominations are forwarded nor nominees are spared well in time.
3. Transportation facilities (vehicles) are not sufficient..
4. Neither training aids are proper, nor multimedia and laptops are provided.
5. Main problem is building. If it is provided the institute could work smoothly.
6. Lack of staff. More instructors are required.



7. Staff is always over burdened and stressed. Lots of traveling is involved in conducting two days training for non-programme personnel in 74 districts of Punjab and NWFP. There are only male instructors who have to travel to all the districts and at the same time arrange trainings at PWTI. At least 2 more instructors are required for meeting the schedule of trainings.

#### **Problems Identified by the Faculty of PWTI-KARACHI**

1. Vehicles are not in working condition.
2. Stationary, logistics support not provided in time.
3. Nominations are not received in time and participants keep coming after 2 or 3 days of training.
4. Release of funds is delayed.
5. The instructors are not well trained. They should have necessary knowledge before being deputed to conduct training.
6. Faculty should have foreign training.
7. Multimedia is very essential for training but it is not provided/available.
8. Number of trainees should not be more than 20-25. The participant's up-to 30-40 is not acceptable. The environment is not good. All logistics like AC, transportation, planning of trainees programme should be in place well in time. Sometimes we don't even know the timing of training, and it is conducted in such a short notice.

The Principals and the faculty members were asked about the facilities they needed for the better improvement of the institutes. Suggestions made are presented as under: -

#### **SUGGESTIONS BY INSTRUCTORS OF PWTIs**

1. Staff should be increased to meet the training target. At least two more instructors are required to accomplish the current Annual Training programme.
2. There is need to update the current positions because the instructors of PWTIs teach to the high level professionals so they should be at higher positions. They also need more supporting staff.
3. Own buildings can improve the status of the institutes and their performance.
4. Foreign training is must for the faculty members.
5. Instructors should be given enough time before the training to well prepare the training programme and lectures, which would improve the quality of training.
6. Punctuality, discipline and attendance of participants must be ensured.
7. Trainers need in-country training at NIPA, PIM and other specialized training institutes abroad.
8. Selection criteria, logistics support and foreign training be ensured to all instructors in turn.

9. A BS17 post be created to look after the accounts/administration and training activities of the institutes to avoid the involvement of faculty members in financial/logistical matters. Faculty should be free to conduct the training activities scheduled for the year.
10. It be made mandatory for PWTIs to provide monthly progress reports to the MoPW.
11. PWTIs should be attached with any research institute like NIPS. There should also be working coordination with other training institutes.
12. A programmer be appointed to organize and manage training activities, provide computer literacy training and keep liaison and correspondence with the Ministry.
13. The services of officers/officials of PWDs who have received training should be utilized here at PWTI.

## RECOMMENDATIONS BY PRINCIPALS OF PWTIs

### PWTI – LAHORE

- ♣ Own Building
- ♣ New Furniture
- ♣ Faculty members should be given foreign training
- ♣ Computer Lab and Library
- ♣ Auditorium
- ♣ Number of Staff be increased
- ♣ Programmer for the Computer Lab/literacy
- ♣ Consultant(s) to prepare Training Modules

### PWTI – KARACHI

- ♣ Own Building, which should look like an institute
- ♣ Foreign qualified Staff
- ♣ Staff with teaching background
- ♣ Laptop Computers for Instructors
- ♣ Photocopier
- ♣ Scanner
- ♣ Refrigerator
- ♣ Motorbike for delivering mail



## **CHAPTER 5**

### **PERCEPTIONS OF TRAINED PERSONNEL**

This chapter presents a review of programme personnel trained by the PWTIs during 2002-2005. Their background characteristics, trainings received, the extent of learning, perceptions and evaluation about the trainings received and their orientation towards Population Welfare Programme and policies are exhibited in length in the following paragraphs.

The programme personnel of various cadres who are trained at PWTIs include Directors, District Population Welfare Officers, Deputy District Population Welfare Officers, Assistant District Population Welfare Officers, Tehsil Population Welfare Officers, Assistant Directors, Deputy Directors, Deputy Secretaries, Deputy Demographers, officials of Population Welfare Departments and Ministry of Population Welfare including Section Officers, Statistical Investigators, Scientific Officers, Statistical Officers, Medical Officers, Principals, Senior Instructors/Instructors, Sister Tutors, Administrative Officers, Accountants, Superintendents, Drawing and Disbursing Officers, Librarians, Assistants, Storekeepers, Steno Typists, UDCs, LDCs, Family Welfare Workers, Family Welfare Counselors, Family Welfare Assistants (Male), Family Welfare Assistants (Female) and others.

For the purpose of analysis, these trainees are grouped into three categories: the Officers, Supporting Staff and Service Providers. A representative sample was drawn from each cadre separately. The percentage distribution of programme personnel interviewed by cadre, designation, province and PWTIs is reflected in Table 5.1.

Data in Table 5.1 indicate that a total of 303 trainees were interviewed, 153 trained by the PWTI-Lahore and 150 trained by the PWTI-Karachi. Out of total trainees, 42 percent were officers, 15 percent were supporting staff and 43 percent service providers. Among the trainees of PWTI-Lahore 93 belonged to Punjab, 48 to NWFP, 5 to



AJK and 7 to Northern areas and among trainees of PWTI-Karachi, 100 trainees were from Sindh and 50 from Balochistan.

The overall distribution of trainees by designation at both the PWTIs shows that highest percentage of trainees are FWWs (20 percent) followed by DPWOs (11 percent), Male FWAs (11 percent), Female FWAs (9 percent), DDPWOs (9 percent), TPWOs (8 percent) and others by each category (5 percent or less).

Table 5.1 also shows distribution of trainees by designation trained at PWTI-Lahore and PWTI-Karachi separately.

**TABLE 5.1**  
**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL WHO RECEIVED**  
**TRAINING(s) AT PWTIs BY DESIGNATION AND BY REGION**

Designation	PWTI-Lahore					PWTI-Karachi			All
	Punjab	NWFP	AJK	NA	Total	Sindh	Balochis- tan	Total	
<b>Officers</b>									42.1
DPWO	7.5	10.4	40.0		9.2	8.0	24.0	13.3	11.2
DDPWO	10.8	14.6		14.3	11.8	7.0	6.0	6.7	9.2
ADPWO	3.2	2.1		14.3	3.3	2.0		1.3	2.3
TPWO	9.7	4.2			7.2	11.0	4.0	8.7	7.9
Assistant Director	2.2	2.1			2.0		6.0	2.0	2.0
Dy. Director						1.0	2.0	1.3	0.7
Dy. Demographer		2.1			0.7				0.3
Officers of PWD/MOPW						1.0		0.7	0.3
Section Officers						2.0		1.3	0.7
Scientific Officer						1.0		0.7	0.3
Statistical Officer	5.4	4.2			4.6		2.0	0.7	2.6
Medical Officer	4.3				2.6	3.0		2.0	2.3
Principal	1.1				0.7				0.3
Sr. Instructor/ Instructor	1.1				0.7	3.0		2.0	1.3
Admn. Officer						2.0		1.3	0.7
<b>Supporting Staff</b>									15
Accountant	2.2	4.2			2.6	1.0		0.7	1.7
Superintendent	1.1				0.7		2.0	0.7	0.7
Assistant	5.4				3.3	5.0	10.0	6.7	5.0
Storekeeper	2.2	8.3	20.0		4.6	3.0	2.0	2.7	3.6
Steno/Typist	1.1				0.7	2.0	6.0	3.3	2.0
UDC/LDC	5.4				3.3	1.0		0.7	2.0
<b>Service Provider</b>									42.9
FWW	22.6	14.6	20.0		19.0	25.0	14.0	21.3	20.1
FWC	1.1	6.3			2.6	2.0		1.3	2.0
FWA (Male)	5.4	14.6		42.9	9.8	8.0	20.0	12.0	10.9
FWA (Female)	8.6	10.4	20.0	28.6	10.5	11.0	2.0	8.0	9.2
Other		2.1			0.7	1.0		0.7	0.7
<b>Total</b>									
Percent	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Number	93	48	5	7	153	100	50	150	303

## DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS

The personnel trained by PWTIs constitute the core team who mainly motivate masses in favour of small family norms and practice of family planning methods. Certainly their job efficiency mainly depends upon the skills they learn during the professional training. Looking at the personnel inventories of trainees to find a relationship between role of non-clinical training on their resource development and personal motivation and assessing the cumulative impact of the two factors on their professional efficiency has the potential of providing one explanation on the overall productivity of the Population Welfare Programme in Pakistan. In this backdrop, the information has been obtained from trainees regarding their fertility, educational status, gender, age, marital status and number of living children. Table 5.2 shows the background characteristics by cadre and by PWTIs.

### Gender

Overall among all trainees of the two institutes, males are proportionately higher (61 percent) compared to females (39 percent) out of programme personnel trained by PWTI-Lahore. Among the cadre of officers, the percentage of males 80% and 81% and for females 20% and 19% at PWTIs Lahore and Karachi respectively. However among the services providers, the relationship is reverse. For example at PTWI Lahore females are 3 times (75 percent) compared to males (25 percent). To some extent the same pattern is seen in the gender composition of trainees at PWTI- Karachi.

This shows that there is a clear gender disparity among the beneficiaries of non-clinical training. Because of the limitation of this study it was not possible to find out if there as an is overall gender imbalance within the staff of Population Welfare Programme as reflected in the gender composition of beneficiaries of non-clinical training or for some other reasons. In any case, it is important that gender disparity should be minimized.



### **Age Pattern**

Data presented in Table 5.2 indicate that overall 57 percent trainees are below 40 years of age and 43 percent are 40 years and above. Among the trainees at PWTI-Lahore 32.9 percent, 32.2 percent, 16.4 percent and 18.4 percent are in age groups 20-29 years, 30-39 years, 40-49 years and 50 years and above respectively. Whereas among the trainees at PWTI-Karachi the highest percentage of trainees are in age group 30-39 (35 percent) followed by age group 40-49 years (33 percent), age group 50 and above (19 percent) and age group 20-29 (13 percent). This shows that principal beneficiaries are young group and mostly the new entrants.

### **Marital Status**

As regards marital status (Table 5.2) overall about 80 percent of the respondents are married while 20 percent are never married.

### **Number of Living Children**

A cadre-wise analysis of programme personnel trained by the PWTI-Lahore indicates that overall 17 percent do not have any child whereas 8 percent of the personnel trained by PWTI-Karachi do not have children. About 40 percent of the personnel trained by PWTI-Lahore have one or two living children and 25 percent have 3 or 4 children, whereas 17 percent of the trainees have 5 and more children. A cadre-wise analysis shows that among officers (15 percent), among supporting staff a fairly good percentage 37 percent and among services providers 10 percent have more than 5 children, although this percentage is quite high but lower than the highest number of children (which were seven) reported in previous studies. Nearly same pattern is observed among the programme personnel trained by PWTI-Karachi.

### **Education**

Among the trainees 38 percent have Master level education, 20 percent have BA/B.Sc. degree, 17 percent each have either an FA or Matric qualification.

The cadre-wise analysis of attainment of education by the trainees at PWTI-Lahore reveals that among officers 62 percent have Master's Degree education, 18



percent are medical graduates, 14 percent are BA/B.Sc, 2 percent are FA and 3 percent Matriculation. Among support staff the highest percentage (41.7 percent) are having FA qualification followed by BA graduates (25 percent), Matric (16.7 percent), and MA (12.5 percent). Among the service providers, 42 percent are matriculation, 28 percent FA, 22 percent are BA/B.Sc and 8 percent have master level education.

Analysis of education level of trainees at PWTI-Karachi exhibits that among officers 66 percent have Master level education followed by 13 percent medical graduates, 11 percent, BA/B.Sc graduates, 5 percent have FA and 2 percent have Matriculation certificate. Among the Supporting Staff 62% have MA/M.Sc level education. Further details are provided in Table 5.2.

TABLE 5.2

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY  
DEMOGRAPHIC CHARACTERISTICS**

Demographic characteristics		PWTI-Lahore				PWTI-Karachi				All
		Officer	Supporting Staff	Service Providers	Total	Officer	Supporting Staff	Service Providers	Total	
Sex	Male	80.0	95.8	25.0	59.5	80.6	100.0	29.7	62.0	60.7
	Female	20.0	4.2	75.0	40.5	19.4		70.3	38.0	39.3
Age	20 - 29	32.8	20.8	37.5	32.9	1.6	4.2	28.1	13.3	23.2
	30 - 39	32.8	29.2	32.8	32.2	25.8	12.5	51.6	34.7	33.4
	40 - 49	15.6	12.5	18.8	16.4	40.3	58.3	17.2	33.3	24.8
	50 +	18.8	37.5	10.9	18.4	32.3	25.0	3.1	18.7	18.5
Marital Status	Married	76.6	83.3	64.1	72.4	96.8	95.8	75.0	87.3	79.8
	Never Married	23.4	16.7	35.9	27.6	3.2	4.2	25.0	12.7	20.2
Living Children	0	15.2	5.3	24.4	17.0	5.0	4.3	14.9	8.5	12.3
	1	23.9	10.5	14.6	17.9	8.3		12.8	8.5	12.7
	2	21.7	15.8	26.8	22.6	10.0	21.7	19.1	15.4	18.6
	3	23.9	15.8	12.2	17.9	11.7	21.7	25.5	18.5	18.2
	4		15.8	12.2	7.5	31.7	21.7	8.5	21.5	15.3
	5+	15.2	36.8	9.8	17.0	33.3	30.4	19.1	27.7	22.9
Education	Matric	3.1	16.7	42.2	21.6	1.6	8.3	23.4	12.0	16.8
	F.A	1.5	41.7	28.1	19.0	4.8	12.5	26.6	15.3	17.2
	B.A/B.Sc	13.8	25.0	21.9	19.0	11.3	16.7	31.3	20.7	19.8
	MA/M.Sc	61.5	12.5	7.8	31.4	66.1	62.5	18.8	45.3	38.3
	MBBS	18.5			7.8	12.9			5.3	6.6
	Other	1.5	4.2		1.3	3.2			1.3	1.3
Total	Percent	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Number	65	24	64	153	62	24	64	150	303

## **HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT**

Training is a major source to develop and enhances the professional competency of any programme personnel. During review of the number of trainings received by various cadres of trainees, it is observed that on the whole each of the programme personnel has attended at least one training and maximum of four trainings during the span of service. Overall 59 percent have attended one training course, 31 percent have attended 2, 8 percent have attended three and 2 percent have attended 4 training courses. Among the total 303 trainees, 127 are Officers, 48 Supporting Staff and 128 Service providers.

Among the officers trainees, (2002-2005), 42 percent, 38 percent, 15 percent, and 5 percent have availed one, two, three or four opportunities of trainings respectively.

Among supporting staff, 58 percent have received only one training. 40 percent 2 and 2 percent received 3 trainings. Among service providers, 76 percent, 21 percent, and 3 percent have received one, two or three trainings respectively.

This analysis shows that officers are the major or principal resource/beneficiaries developed by the non-clinical training. The frequency of trainings by all the cadres also reveals that the trainees have been trained on the various aspects of their jobs.

**TABLE 5.3**

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY CADRE AND BY  
NUMBER OF TRAINING(s) RECEIVED 2002 - 2005**

	Training				Total	Number
	1	2	3	4		
Offices	42.5	37.8	15.0	4.7	100	127
Supporting Staff	58.3	39.6	2.1	0.0	100	48
Service Provider	75.8	21.1	3.1	0.0	100	128
Total	59.1	31.0	7.9	2.0	100	303

Before reviewing the perception of trainees about the training received, it would be better to look at the types of training conducted during the period of study 2002-2005.



List of all trainings courses conducted by PWTI-Lahore and PWTI-Karachi during 2002-2005 is as under: -

### **Title of Training Courses**

1. Counseling for Reproductive Health, Contraceptive use, Skill Development and Leadership.
2. Interpersonal Communication (IPC) and Client Motivation.
3. Pre-service Training
4. Monitoring, Supervision and Evaluation.
5. Master Trainers: Role of Nazims, Naib Nazims in promotion of PWP and Male Mobilizer and registration.
6. Presentation Skill Development
7. Office Procedures/Management, District maintenance and Report-writing.
8. Management Information System (MIS)
9. New Accounting Model, Administrative & Financial Management and DDO powers etc.
10. Warehouse, Record keeping, Store Management and Contraceptive Logistic System.
11. Computer Literacy.
12. Human Resource Development.
13. Registration.
14. Strategic Planning & Management/Development.
15. Advocacy, Communication and Behaviour Change
16. Curriculum Development.
17. Career Management and Grooming of Officers.
18. Manners and etiquettes.

## **EVALUATION OF TRAINING**

### **The Extent of Learning**

Evaluation of training component is required to assess the level of achievements of the objectives and targets. The programme personnel were asked number of questions about the extent of knowledge they gained through training, the training contents, methodology, duration, presentation of lectures, strength of the class, training material, training arrangements, facilities provided during training, venue of training, relevance of training to respective job description, awareness of population policies and the level of satisfaction after the training.



Under human resource development (HRD), the programme personnel were provided training according to their job requirements and an employee working in one position needed training more than once on various topics. It was noticed that a fairly good number of personnel have received training more than once. While evaluating training the personnel were divided into three main categories, the Officers, the Service Providers and Supporting Staff because specific training courses were organized for different cadres according to their needs. They were asked the same set of questions for each training course they had received. But those who received only one type of training course were asked a set of questions only once. Responses on the whole are presented in the report whereas detail of responses regarding the assessment and usefulness of the training by each cadre, PWTI and province is given in annexure Table 7 and 8.

The first question was about the extent of learning from the contents of the training, and the responses of personnel of each cadre against all training courses attended are given in Table 5.4.

The study found that among all the trainees who received only one training course, 18 percent perceived extent of learning as 'a lot', 45 percent as 'adequately', 22 percent as 'to some extent', 14 percent 'little or very little while less than one percent perceived learning as 'not at all'.

The extent of learning from the second training reported as "adequate", to some extent, and "not at all" was 33 percent, 32 percent and 19 percent respectively for all trainees; whereas 15 percent of trainees reported that they had learned "a lot" from training.

Almost same pattern was found for the third training. And the extent of learning reported as "adequate", "to some extent", "little/very little" was 39 percent, 36 percent and 11 percent respectively. The rest of trainees replied that they learned "a lot" from training. In case of forth training, one fourth of trainees reported a lot of learning and rest of them reported adequate and to some extent learning. The scores of learning by various cadres are also presented in Table 5.4. The level of learning for the officers was in the lower side during first training while at the high side when ranking the third and forth training.

TABLE 5.4

## PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES BY CADRE AND BY EXTENT OF LEARNING

	Officers	Supporting Staff	Service Providers	Total	
	%	%	%	%	Number
<b>Training-1</b>					
1) Not at All	1.6	0.0	0.0	0.7	2
2) Very Little	4.8	2.1	3.1	3.6	11
3) Little	11.1	10.4	10.2	10.6	32
4) To some extent	19.8	31.3	20.3	21.9	66
5) Adequate	46.8	43.8	43.8	45.0	136
6) A lot	15.9	12.5	22.7	18.2	55
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	302
<b>Training-2</b>					
1) Not at All	1.5	0.0	0.0	0.9	1
2) Very Little	4.5	0.0	3.1	3.4	4
3) Little	16.4	27.8	6.3	15.4	18
4) To some extent	29.9	27.8	37.5	31.6	37
5) Adequate	29.9	27.8	43.8	33.3	39
6) A lot	17.9	16.7	9.4	15.4	18
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	117
<b>Training-3</b>					
1) Very Little	8.3			7.1	2
2) Little	4.2			3.6	1
3) To some extent	25.0	100.0	100.0	35.7	10
4) Adequate	45.8			39.3	11
5) A lot	16.7			14.3	4
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	28
<b>Training-4</b>					
1) To some extent	50.0			50.0	2
2) Adequate	25.0			25.0	1
3) A lot	25.0			25.0	1
Total	100.0			100.0	4

Those who scored the extent of learning in the range of 1-3 and 4-6 were further probed for giving these scores and the reasons reported are very elaborated and presented in their own words in Table 5.5 and 5.6.



TABLE 5.5

PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF REASONS REPORTED TO SCORE 1-3 (NOT AT ALL, VERY LITTLE, LITTLE) FOR LEARNING FROM THE TRAINING(S)

	Responses	Total	
		%	Number
1	Learned very little because it was 1 <sup>st</sup> training, did not had background knowledge.	3.3	10
2	The number of participants was too many (around 60).	1.0	3
3	Irrelevant topic e.g. the subject was Warehouse Management but they taught us about responsibilities of FWAs and use of contraceptives.	3.0	9
4	Resource person was not good/had no knowledge/not clear about the subject/did not deliver properly/training methodology was not good	3.6	11
5	Duration of training was too short.	4.3	13
6	Repetition of course contents/all had learnt before.	1.3	4
7	No relevant explanation was given.	10.4	32

TABLE 5.6

PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF REASONS REPORTED TO SCORE 4-6 (TO SOME EXTENT, ADEQUATE, A LOT) FOR LEARNING FROM THE TRAINING(S)

	Responses	Total	
		%	Number
1	Learned a lot because it was first comprehensive and informative training.	17.2	52
2	Before this training they knew nothing about Population Welfare Programme. They learned many new things about PWP that enabled them perform better in the field.	10.9	33
3	Training was job/subject related. Learned about office procedures, working behaviour with staff and tips to obtain better output from the staff. I also learnt how to manage FWCs.	29.0	88
4	Training methodology was good, trainers were good, instructors delivered well.	13.5	41
5	Learned through interaction with other participants. Enhanced confidence building.	1.7	5
6	This was 1 <sup>st</sup> training i.e. pre-service and was very useful for job. The training was held at NIPA-Karachi and the resource persons were very knowledgeable.	0.7	2
7	The training was job related and the subject was very important. We learnt 9 points about Reproductive Health and counseling. We learnt how to start the work of counseling in a village. 1 <sup>st</sup> to approach Maulvi sahib, Member, School teacher etc. Learned in detail about interpersonal communication, which is useful for a field worker. Learned the importance of communication skill in Family Planning and how to use this skill.	5.6	17
8	Training of storekeepers was arranged first time and learned a lot i.e. maintenance of store, to keep the contraceptives/medicines in an airy cool place, contraceptives/medicines be issued according to requirement. Logistic System of Contraceptives and proper filling of forms were also taught.	2.0	6
9	Training of Statistical Assistant was job related i.e. MIS system, calculation of CYP and maintaining files.	0.3	1
10	Learned a lot from training such as opening of files, parts of files, service rules, job and power of DDO/maintenance of cashbook. Learned about leave rules, pay rules and budget.	1.7	5
11	Learnt about presentation skill. Computer software i.e. power point, use of audiovisual and IEC material.	2.3	7
12	The training specifically arranged for doctors was very useful.	0.3	1
13	Learnt about Mother & Child Health (MCH) Reproductive Health and cleanliness of mother and child.	1.0	3
14	Learned about Role of Male Mobilizer and Role of Nazmeen.	1.3	4
15	Learned about Presentation Skills and Leadership.	0.3	1



## Learning from Training

The trainees were further asked to explain briefly what ever they have learnt from training. Their responses are given in Table 5.7 below.

TABLE 5.7

### PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES BY REPORTED EXPLANATION OF LEARNING FROM TRAINING(S) (MULTIPLE RESPONSES)

	Explanation of Learning	%	Number
1	No relevant explanation was given. Did not learn from the training.	5.6	17
2	This was my 1st training i.e. pre-service and was very useful for me. The training was held at NIPA-Karachi and the resource persons were knowledgeable. Learned about the subjects i.e. Office Management/Demographic trends and situation. We also visited the Service Outlets and other departments. During training at NIPA-Karachi we met senior officers in Advance Course and shared ideas with them. This experience was very useful for us. We also learned how to do research.	5.9	18
3	Learnt that how to/greet meet the women in the field/community and counsel them for family Planning. The training was job related and the subject was very important. We learnt 9 points about Reproductive Health and counseling as well. We learnt how to start the work of counseling in a village. 1st to approach Maulvi sahib, Member, School teacher etc. Learnt in detail about Interpersonal Communication, which is useful for a field worker. Learnt the importance of communication skill in Family Planning and how to use this skill. Learnt about skill development, motivation and counseling. Maintain secrecy of the client and office discipline, reporting and recording/record keeping. The technique of "GATHER" was also taught. Learnt about Registration of eligible couples.	43.2	131
4	Training of store keepers was arranged fist time and I learnt a lot i.e. maintenance of store, to keep the contraceptives/medicines in an airy cool place, formula 1st serve was learnt, contraceptives/medicines be issued according to requirement, taking consideration of above, no expiry, no shortage will be faced. Learnt about Logistic System of Contraceptives and proper filling of forms i.e. CLR-7, 6,15. Learnt about the maintenance of store record in a better way and also use of bin card (FIFO).	5.6	17
5	Learnt a lot from the training such as opening of files, parts of files, noting and drafting, service rules, Job and powers of DDO/maintenance of cashbook. Learned about leave rules, GPF, Pension rules, pay rules and budget. Learned about Accounts maintenance. Learnt about enquiry procedure, E & D rules, TA/DA. Account maintenance and to make different heads of budget. Internal Audit/budget and expenditure. NAM & Financial matters/powers and reconciliation.	13.2	40
6	Learnt about presentation skill. Computer software i.e. power point, use of multimedia and IEC material.	7.6	23

	Explanation of Learning	%	Number
7	Learnt about Contraceptives, Islam and Family Planning. Learned about use and side effects of contraceptive and injection. Sterilization. Septic techniques.	8.9	27
8	Learnt about Mother & Child Health (MCH) Reproductive Health and cleanliness of mother and child. Antenatal and postnatal care.	5.3	16
9	Learned about role of Male Mobilizer and Role of Nazimeen.	2.0	6
10	Learned about presentation skills, report writing and Leadership. Preparation of work plan. Curriculum development.	3.2	18
11	Before this training I knew nothing about Population Welfare Programme. I learned many new things about PWP, which enables me perform better in the field. Learnt in detail about past, present and future policies of Population Welfare Programme and how to decrease population growth rate by using different channels. Consequences of population and population data etc.	9.2	28
12	Training was job/subject related. Learned about office procedures, working behavior with staff and tips to obtain better output from the staff. I also learnt how to manage FWCs. Office etiquettes/manners/punctuality/behavior change.	6.6	20
13	Monitoring, Supervision and Management, Administration of DPWOs offices and FWCs. Supervision of field activities and difference between monitoring and supervision. Qualities of a good Manager/Leader and leadership.	3.3	10
14	Learnt how to train Male Mobilizers and FWAs, RMPs, Hakeemes etc. Qualities of trainer.	4.3	13
15	Others: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Training of Statistical Assistant was job related i.e. MIS system, therefore was very useful. Learnt about proper filling of different forms and calculation of CYP (0.3%)</li> <li>• Learnt about step down training. (0.3%)</li> <li>• How to maintain data of district/district profile. (0.7%)</li> <li>• Development of self-confidence. How to raise the standard of living of the people?. (1.7%)</li> </ul>	3.0	9
<b>Total</b>		303	

### The Best About Training

All the programme personnel were asked, "What did you like the best about the training?" The responses shed light on the quality of training provided by the PWTIs on the non-clinical aspect of the Population Welfare Programme. A review of the data collected from both the institutes on this subject shows that in total 42 percent of the personnel of which 26 percent from PWTI-Karachi and 16 percent from PWTI-Lahore liked the training arrangements, discipline, atmosphere, presentations, accommodation, methodology and environment of the training. A total of 23 percent of which 14 percent from PWTI-Karachi and 9 percent from PWTI-Lahore reported that they liked the lecture



delivered by retired personnel from the MoPW. They delivered excellent and very informative lectures. Almost 12 percent of the total (9 percent from PWTI-Karachi and 3 percent PWTI-Lahore) liked the close interaction among the participants/personnel working all over Pakistan. They found it very pleasant occasion/event to interact with each other and share ideas about Population Programme and its policies.

About 7 percent of the participants expressed that training was very much job related and therefore they liked it. Almost 7 percent of the trainees liked the role-play and participatory approach of teaching used during the training, about 5 percent liked the lecture on Islam and Family Planning and the same percent reported the lectures were very interesting and informative delivered on the subjects of Mother and Child Health, Reproductive Health, the use of Family Planning methods to reduce population growth and information on diseases related to women. Detail of some other responses expressed by the trainees is given in Table 5.8.



TABLE 5.8

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL  
BY LIKENESS OF THE TRAINING(s)**

	Like the Best About Training	Lahore	Karachi	Total	
		%	%	%	Number
1	Training was job/subject related therefore I liked it very much.	2.3	4.6	6.9	21
2	The training was very informative to enhance knowledge. I liked this very much.	1.0	3.0	4.0	12
3	Lectures from resource persons (Feroz Hayat, Gazala, Israr, Shakeela, Akbar, Dr. Zubair, Arona Saba, Sultan, Akhtar, Rana sahib, Wahid Sahib, Noor Nawaz, Khalid, Aslam Pervaiz, Mehar Sahib, Javaid Sahib) were excellent.	9.2	14.2	23.4	71
4	NIPA-Karachi hostel was fine and comfortable and the lectures were informative. NIPA Karachi arranged visits to different departments, which were useful and liked by us.	0.3	0.0	0.3	1
5	Liked the role-play and participatory approach of teaching.	1.0	1.0	2.0	6
6	The training was arranged at hometown Peshawar. Being a lady I preferred to be trained at my hometown.	0.3	0.0	0.3	1
7	The participants came from different districts/provinces. We interacted with each other and shared ideas, which were useful for us.	2.6	9.2	11.9	36
8	Lecture on Islam and Family Planning.	5.0	0.0	5.0	15
9	I liked the lecture on treatment of minor ailments, it was very useful.	0.3*	0.0	0.3	1
10	A detailed lecture on PWP/FP was informative, enhanced my knowledge, which is useful while conducting field visits.	0.7	0.7	1.3	4
11	Liked the lecture on Contraceptive Logistic System. Store maintenance.	0.7	0.7	1.3	4
12	Liked the lecture on Inter Personal Communication	1.0	0.0	1.0	3
13	Demographic situation of Pakistan and concept of Demography.	1.3	0.0	1.3	4
14	Learnt about computer. It is good training.	1.0	0.6	1.6	5
15	Lecture on Mother and Child Health (MCH), RH and contraceptives. the use of family planning methods to reduce population growth and information on women diseases.	4.6	0.7	5.3	16
16	Liked the lectures on Counseling/Motivation, male mobilization, communication and awareness rising. Monitoring and evaluation.	1.0	0.3	1.3	4
17	Training contents, arrangement, discipline, atmosphere, punctuality, presentation, behavior, accommodation, methodology, environment, was very good. I liked that.	15.8	25.7	41.6	126
18	Handouts were good and informative/useful.	0.3	0.3	0.7	2
19	Liked lecture on leave and pension rules. TA/DA rules etc.	0.7	0.7	1.3	4
20	Satellite camps and Health issues and involvement of Hakims.	0.3	0.0	0.3	1
21	Office management, maintenance of file, noting, drafting and office procedures. Code of conduct etc.	0.3	0.0	0.3	1
22	Liked lecture on infections and treatment.	0.3	0.0	0.3	1
23	Enjoyed sightseeing. Visit to Hospital/FWC. Visit to PTV and Radio Station. Arranged practical training.	1.7	1.7	3.3	10
24	Answer was not relevant to the question/ No response.	4.0	1.0	5.0	15
25	Training was just wastage of time i.e. nothing to like about.	0.7	0.0	0.7	2
26	Nothing, because training was not subject related. Trainers were not good. Administration not good. Time was short. Training arrangement not good. No electricity.	0.0	0.3	0.3	1
<b>Total</b>		153	150	303	

### **Training was not as Expected**

Before coming to the training venue every participant has some expectations and mind set about the training course. In this study effort was made to cater the expectation that programme personnel had about the training courses provided by the PWTIs. They were asked to tell what they did not learn which they expected to learn from the training. The purpose to ask this question was to get the feed back from the trainees about the future designing of training programmes at PWTIs.

The gathered data exhibit that 7 percent of the personnel did not have any particular expectation about the training. Answer of 31 percent personnel was not relevant to the question. About 13 percent reported that training was all according to expectations. Computer learning was expected by 13 percent of the personnel. About 10 percent expected to learn about office management and procedures, office work, service rules etc. About 8 percent replied that training was not up to what they expected to learn since it was totally irrelevant and nothing related to their jobs. Table 5.9 shows the detail of all responses collected.



**TABLE 5.9**

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF EXPECTATIONS FROM THE  
TRAININGS AS EXPECTED**

	Responses	Lahore	Karachi	Total	
		%	%	%	Number
1	Training was all according to expectation/subject/topic. Learnt a lot.	7.9	5.0	12.9	39
2	Expected to learn the following but could not learn				
	• Report Writing and Presentation Skill.	0.6	0.3	1.0	3
	• Treatment of minor ailments. Human pathology and general medicines, injection, Multiload/Cu-T. Infertility and Health.	2.0	0.3	2.4	7
	• Islam and Family Planning.	1.7	0.0	1.7	5
	• Computer learning/literacy. Electronic Data Management.	3.6	9.6	13.2	40
	• Motivation, Counseling. Confidence building, advocacy/communication, Client dealing and male mobilization.	1.3	4.0	5.2	16
	• About MCH and RH, tubiligation, DNC etc. vasectomy. Multiload. Cu-T.	1.3	2.6	4.0	12
	• Office management and procedures, administration, office work, service rules, noting and drafting, E & D rules and regulations. Financial/accounts matters, management, budget and pension rules. NAM. TA/DA, Pay Bills, maintenance of vehicles.	3.2	6.6	9.9	30
	• About Field activities. Field problems and solution.	0.7	0.3	1.0	3
	• M.I.S, Monitoring and Supervision.	0.3	1.4	1.7	5
	• Report and Record keeping, new contraceptive methods and five-year plan.	0.7	2.6	3.3	10
	• Population Policy. Population Welfare Programme. Pre-Service training. Master trainers training and preparation of PC-1.	0.3	2.4	2.7	8
3	No expectation.	4.3	2.3	6.6	20
4	Training was not upto what expected to learn, or not job related. Was not up to standard. No practical training.	6.9	4.0	10.9	33
5	Answer was not relevant to the question/ No response.	17.2	13.5	30.7	93
Number		153	150	303	



### **Duplication/Repetition of Training**

“To what extent the training duplicated what you had learned previously” was one of the questions asked from the interviewees to know whether the courses were revised according to current needs or repeated what had been taught for years. Data presented in table 5.10 show that the most repeated subjects during training were motivation, counseling, advocacy, IPC and role play etc. These concepts are repeated in almost all training courses. About 26 percent could not give relevant answer to the question. Lecture on Islam and Family Planning and use and side effects of contraceptives is stated by 12 percent of the personnel. About 10 percent of personnel reported that the whole training was repetition of what they had learnt before. These personnel may be the repeaters and did not find anything new in the training. About 6 percent found concepts of Population Policy and office management were repeated subjects. Drafting, letter writing and file work found repeated by 8 percent of the trainees. Four percent of the programme personnel found repetition of lectures on each computer, store maintenance, pension rules, new accounting model, population and development issues, and mother and child health.

These responses give us an insight of the course contents, which needs to be supervised or modified. Training contents should be designed to meet the job needs of employees and new challenges of time.

TABLE 5.10

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES WHO THOUGHT THE  
TRAINING WAS DUPLICATION**

	Responses	Lahore	Karachi	Total	
		%	%	%	Number
1	<b>Repeated Topics</b>				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The whole training was duplication.</li> </ul>	8.9	1.0	9.9	30
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Office Management/office work/Administrative rules, Service rules and regulations, Pension rules and New Accounting Model.</li> </ul>	2.9	7.3	10.2	31
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Population Policy of Population Welfare Programme.</li> </ul>	2.6	3.6	6.3	19
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Islam and Family Planning. Use and Side Effects of Contraceptives.</li> </ul>	4.3	7.6	11.9	36
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Computer literacy.</li> </ul>	0.7	2.3	3.0	9
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Motivation, Counseling and Advocacy, Inter personal Communication skill, Role Play, Behaviour Change and Public dealing.</li> </ul>	3.0	11.2	14.2	43
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Presentation skill.</li> </ul>	0.3	0.7	1.0	3
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Store maintenance. Record keeping, Registration and Contraceptive Logistic System.</li> </ul>	2.6	1.3	3.6	12
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>How to inject and sterilization. General ailments and medicines.</li> </ul>	1.0	0.3	1.3	4
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Job description.</li> </ul>	0.7	0.3	1.0	3
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Drafting, letter writing and file work. Recording and reporting.</li> </ul>	1.3	6.6	7.9	24
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Functions of Male Mobilizer.</li> </ul>	0.3	0.3	0.3	2
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Population development/Population issues and solutions/ Demographic situation.</li> </ul>	1.7	0.7	0.0	7
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Mother and child Health (MCH) and Reproductive Health issues. Population indicators such as growth rate, IMR, MMR, TFR, CPR etc.</li> </ul>	1.0	2.0	2.0	9
2	Answer was not relevant to the question/ No response.	18.8	7.3	26.1	79
3	It was first training and every thing was new.	3.3	2.3	5.6	17
Number		153	150	303	



### Part of Training to be Included or Excluded from the Contents

The programme personnel selected for interview were further inquired which part of the training they thought very important and be included in the future training courses and which part they found irrelevant and must be excluded from the training. The responses have been compiled and presented in Table 5.11 and Table 5.12.

**TABLE 5.11**  
**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES AND THE TITLE(S)**  
**RECOMENMDED TO BE INCLUDED IN THE TRAINING(S)**

	To be included	Lahore	Karachi	Total	
		%	%	%	Number
1	Practical demonstration and role-play.	0.0	0.3	0.3	1
2	New techniques of MIS.	1.0	1.7	2.6	8
3	Communication skill and Behaviour change, STD, RTIs, AIDS, Counseling, Motivation, Advocacy and IPC.	2.6	6.9	9.6	29
4	The power of DDO, Maintenance of service book and office procedures, TA/DA rules and accounts, Pension rules and noting and drafting.	0.9	3.2	3.6	11
5	Job specific and practical trainings including problems and solutions.	3.6	3.3	6.9	21
6	A new topic i.e. Reproductive Health and skill development.	0.7	3.6	4.3	13
7	Islam and Family Planning.	1.3	0.7	2.0	6
8	General medicine/treatment/first aid, emergency cases and training about contraceptives.	4.0	2.2	5.9	18
9	Human Pathology, Gynecology, Handling and caring of emergency cases, Deliveries.	2.3	3.0	2.3	16
10	Copper-T and multiload.	0.7	0.7	1.3	4
11	New methods of family planning/ New contraceptive technology.	2.3	1.0	3.3	10
12	Health of mother and child (MCH), Nutrition and Health.	0.7	0.7	1.3	4
13	New theories of population, Demographic situation of Pakistan and other countries.	2.3	1.3	3.6	11
14	Management issues, Office management, Auction procedures, Administration.	1.3	2.0	3.3	10
15	Provincial rules and regulations and empowerment.	0.7	0.3	1.0	3
16	Monitoring and evaluation.	0.3	0.3	0.7	2
17	Computer literacy including MS Word, Excel and practical training. Use of Multimedia.	0.0	0.3	0.3	1
18	Presentation skill.	5.6	16.2	21.8	66
19	Population education, Population Policy, Strategic Planning and Management.	0.0	1.0	1.0	3
20	Efficiency and Disciplinary (E & D) Rules, Rules and Regulations.	0.0	1.3	1.3	4
21	Answer was not relevant to the question/No response.	22.8	11.9	34.7	105
Number		153	150	303	



TABLE 5.12

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF TRAINEES AND THE TITLE(S)  
RECOMMENDED TO BE EXCLUDED FROM THE TRAINING(S)**

	To be excluded	Lahore	Karachi	Total	
		%	%	%	Number
1	All old syllabuses, topics, contents including instructors are boring and irrelevant. The training is just wasting of time.	2.6	0.7	3.3	10
2	Motivation, counseling, communication and behaviour techniques, advocacy and IEC.	1.0	3.3	4.3	13
3	RH and sex education.	0.7	0.0	0.7	2
4	Contraceptive methods.	0.7	2.6	3.3	10
5	Administrative and Leave Rules. Law (Rules and Regulations). Finance and TA/DA rules	0.0	1.0	1	3
6	Lecture on demographic trend/situation was too lengthy, unnecessary things may be deleted.	0.7	1.3	2	6

### Effectiveness of Training

The question asked was about usefulness of training for their routine work. Responses are indicated in Table 5.13. About 95 percent of the personnel responded that they found the training very useful. The major reason reported for the usefulness was that training course was very much job related which enhanced the skill of the employees. The answers provided by trainees reflected the understanding of what they had learnt from the training course and it equally sheds light on the quality of training they received.

The purpose to get responses about the quality of training provided by PWTIs was in line with the objectives of trainings, whether or not the training improved their understanding of the subject and enhanced their abilities to perform well. They were also asked to respond to what extent they would advise others to attend the same kind of training. Table 5.13 shows that 22 percent of the personnel reported that objectives of the training were fully achieved, 67 percent reported to some extent, 11 percent reported very little while 2 percent said the objectives were not achieved at all.

About 25 percent personnel responded that their knowledge and understand has fully improved. While 64 percent said that understanding improved to some extent and 10 percent said very little and one percent not at all.

About 2 percent of the responded found that training did not at all help to perform their duties well. Whereas 9 percent, 63 percent and 26 percent of the respondents expressed respectively very little, to some extent and fully beneficial from the training.

On the whole 92 percent of respondents found the training was very useful, informative and want to advise others to attend similar training.

TABLE 5.13

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ABOUT OBJECTIVES OF TRAINING(S) UNDERSTANDING OF THE SUBJECT(S) AND ENHANCEMENT OF ABILITIES**

	PWTI-Lahore				PWTI-Karachi				Total
	Number of Trainings				Number of Trainings				
Training was useful for work	1	2	3	4	1	2	3	4	Percentage
Yes	94	94	93	80	97	100	89	100	95.4
No	6.3	5.6	6.7	20	3	0.0	11	0.0	4.6
Training was relevant to work									
Yes	92	96	100	100	93	100	89	100	94.7
No	7.6	3.7	0.0	0.0	7	0.0	11	0.0	5.3
Objectives of the training achieved									
Not at all	2.5	1.9	0.0	20	1	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.7
Very little	8.9	5.6	13	0.0	16	7.5	11	0.0	10.6
To some extent	57	76	67	60	68	73	67	100	67.0
Fully	32	17	20	20	15	20	22	0.0	21.8
Training improved/increased understanding of the subject									
Not at all	1.3	1.9	0.0	0.0	2	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.3
Very little	6.3	9.3	6.7	20	15	7.5	0.0	0.0	9.9
To some extent	60	63	80	60	60	73	89	100	64.0
Fully	33	26	13	20	23	20	11	0.0	24.8
Training helped/ enhanced abilities to perform duties									
Not at all	3.8	0.0	0.0	20	2	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.0
Very little	8.9	7.4	0.0	0.0	12	1	11	0.0	9.2
To some extent	54	63	73	80	65	68	67	0.0	62.7
Fully	33	30	27	0.0	21	23	22	100	26.1
Advise others to attend similar training(s)									
Not at all	2.5	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.7
Little	1.3	3.7	0.0	0.0	3.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	2.0
To some extent	6.3	9.3	27	20	3.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	6.9
Fully	90	87	73	80	94	100	100	100	91.4



## ORIENTATION OF POPULATION WELFARE PROGRAMME

All the trainees were asked whether they were taught about the Population Welfare Programme, its current Policy (2002) and targets. It is interesting to note that only 9 percent of the trainees responded that they were taught about the objectives and targets of the Policy of the Programme in detail. (Table 5.14). However, 10 percent reported that nothing was explained about the policies. Around 81 percent of the programme personnel could not give relevant answer to this question and did not know the current Programme Policy, which is an alarming situation.

Table 5.14 also indicates the responses by various cadres of employees. Among the officers, 13 percent gave positive response and explained about the programme Policy, about 75 percent of them did not give relevant answer and 13 percent denied about the knowledge given in training. It is also astonishing to see that among the supporting staff only 2 percent and among the service providers 9 percent knew about the population Policy of the country.

**TABLE 5.14**

### PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL WHO REPORTED KNOWLEDGE ABOUT THE PROGRAMME POLICY

	Officers	Supporting Staff	Service Provider	Percentage	Number
Yes	12.6	2.1	8.6	9.2	28
Nothing was explained	12.6	10.4	7.8	10.2	31
No relevant explanation	74.8	87.5	83.6	80.5	244
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	303

## PERCEPTIONS ABOUT TRAINING PROCESSES

This study purport to assess the methodology, presentations, duration, class strength, training material, training aids, training arrangements and venue of the trainings in the two PWTIs.. Number of personnel who received more than one training was asked their perceptions about each training course separately.

## METHODOLOGY OF TRAINING AND PRESENTATION OF LECTURE(S)

The majority of the respondents have very positive response about the methodology used by the trainers. They are very satisfied by the approach used in the training. Almost 57 percent, 89 percent and 100 percent of the trainees who attended two, three or four training courses said that mixed approach was used.

Around 25 percent, 18 percent and 7 percent trainees who attended the 1<sup>st</sup> 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> training courses reported that only lectures were delivered and very less discussion sessions were held, whereas 16 percent, 25 percent and 4 percent trainees of the 1<sup>st</sup> 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> training course respectively reported that only participatory approach was used during each session.

The study found that 23 percent, 20 percent and 21 percent of the first, second and third training participants mentioned that presentation of lectures during training was satisfactory, whereas 14 percent, 7 percent and 7.1 percent trainees of the first, the second and the third training respectively commented about the presentation as excellent. Further details are presented in Table 5.15.

TABLE 5.15

PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING METHODOLOGY, PRESENTATIONS AND THE NUMBER OF TRAINING(S) RECEIVED

Training Methodology	Number of Trainings			
	1	2	3	4
Lecture oriented	25.4	17.9	7.1	0.0
Participatory	15.8	24.8	3.6	0.0
Both	57.8	57.3	89.3	100
<b>Presentation of Lectures</b>				
Satisfactory	23.1	19.7	21.4	0.0
Good	28.7	4.1	28.6	25.0
Very good	33.7	32.5	42.9	75.0
Excellent	14.5	6.8	7.1	0.0

## DURATION OF TRAINING AND NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS

Table 5.16 indicates that the majority of the employees (62 percent, 66 percent & 86 percent) who attended 1-3 training courses think that duration of training was just right. They are also satisfied by the duration of training courses. Similarly 28 percent



employees who attended 1 or 2 courses and 11 percent trainees of the third training think the duration was too short.

About 9 percent, 6 percent and 4 percent respondents of the first, the second and the third training respectively stated that the duration of training was too long.

Majority of respondents have positive perceptions about the number of participants in the training courses attended. Almost 89 percent of the participants who attended the first, the second and the third training stated that class strength was just right. The trainees who attended four training courses were 100 satisfied with the number of participants.

Overall 10 percent respondents in each training course stated that number of participants should be less than the number of current participants. More interaction between the participants and the trainers is only possible with less number of participants.

Probing the size of each training course, it was revealed that among the trainees who attended only one training course, 56 percent reported that class strength was 20-25, 34 percent reported the class strength between 15-20 and 10 percent stated that the number of participants were 15 at the maximum. All those who attended four training courses were in the favour that participants in the range of 15-20 were the reasonable number.

**TABLE 5.16**  
**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL BY THEIR**  
**PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING DURATION AND CLASS STRENGTH**  
**AND BY NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED**

Duration of Training	Number of Trainings			
	1	2	3	4
Too short	28.4	28.2	10.7	0.0
Just right	62.4	65.8	85.7	100
Too long	9.2	6.0	3.6	0.0
Class Strength				
0-15	9.9	13.4	3.8	0.0
15-20	34.1	35.7	42.3	100
20-25	56.0	45.5	53.8	0.0
25-30	0.0	5.4	0.0	0.0

## TRAINING MATERIAL AND AUDIO-VISUAL AIDS

The lectures and presentations leave long lasting effect if related handouts and reference material are provided to the participants during training. This study looked into the number of handouts provided, their quality and usefulness for the training. The respondents were asked few questions about the handouts. Table 5.17 shows that almost 80-100 percent trainees think that number of handout were just right while at the maximum of 15 percent reported that number of handouts were inadequate, while needed more reference material.

Regarding quality of handouts, less than 4 percent respondents did not find them relevant. All other participants were satisfied with the quality of handouts and found them useful.

Whether the trainees use those handouts as reference and guidance material later in their routine work, more than 82 percent participants reported that the handouts provided during training were very useful in their work.

The study revealed that among the trainees who attended one training course, 37 percent found the visual aids satisfactory, 29 percent found those good, 25 percent found very good and 9 percent found them excellent. Among the employees who attended the second training course, 28 percent reported very good and 9 percent reported as excellent, while the employees who attended 4 training courses, 75 percent reported audio visual facility was good and the remaining 25 percent reported the facility as satisfactory.



**TABLE 5.17**  
**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL**  
**BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING AIDS AND**  
**BY NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED**

	Number of Trainings			
Number of Handouts	1	2	3	4
Too Few	12.6	15.4	3.6	0.0
Just right	83.4	80.3	92.9	100
Too many	4.4	4.3	3.6	0.0
<b>Quality Handouts</b>				
Very relevant	45.2	28.2	35.7	0.0
Satisfactory	52.5	65.8	60.7	100
Not at all relevant	2.3	6.0	3.6	0.0
<b>Handout Used Latter</b>				
Yes	88.8	82.1	89.3	100
No	11.2	17.9	10.7	0.0
<b>Views on Visual Aids Used</b>				
Satisfactory	37.3	29.9	28.6	25.0
Good	28.7	33.3	39.3	75.0
Very good	24.8	28.2	28.6	0.0
Excellent	9.2	8.6	3.6	0.0

## TRAINING ARRANGEMENTS AND VENUE

Table 5.18 shows the expression of respondents regarding the quality of training arrangements and the venue. About 7 to 10 percent of the participants in various trainings reported excellent training arrangement while the rest of the participants viewed it satisfactory, good or very good.

Training venue was reported as excellent by the trainees in the range of 9-14 percent, while 30-40 percent of participants who attended upto three training courses opined that training venue was good or very good. It is interesting to note that all programme personnel who attended four training courses liked the training venue and training arrangement very much.

TABLE 5.18

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL  
BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON TRAINING ARRANGEMENTS AND VENUE AND  
BY NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED**

Training Arrangements	Number of Trainings			
	1	2	3	4
Satisfaction	25.1	22.2	10.7	0.0
Good	32.0	42.7	46.4	50.0
Very good	33.3	28.2	35.7	50.0
Excellent	9.6	6.9	7.1	0.0
<b>Training Venue</b>				
Satisfactory	28.1	19.7	10.7	0.0
Good	30.7	33.3	39.3	0.0
Very good	32.0	37.6	35.7	100
Excellent	9.2	8.5	14.3	0.0

### NEED FOR ADDITIONAL TRAINING

For the capacity building of programme personnel regular periodical training courses should be imparted. Effective training seeks to sensitize the officials about the cross cutting issues and socio-economic matrix of society responsible for high fertility rate. The study looked into the areas for future training. In this connection the trainees were asked if they needed additional training; if yes identify the areas they required further training. Almost 94 percent, 86 percent and 96 percent of the employees who already had attended one, two and three training courses respectively wished to attend additional training. Among the employees who attended 4 training courses, half (50 percent) were in favor to attend still more training courses while rest of the half were no more interested.

TABLE 5.19

**PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF PROGRAMME PERSONNEL  
BY THEIR PERCEPTIONS ON NEED FOR ADDITIONAL TRAINING AND BY  
NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED**

Need Additional Training	Number of Trainings			
	1	2	3	4
Yes	93.7	86.2	96.4	50.0
No	6.3	12.9	3.6	50.0



## SUGGESTIONS BY TRAINED PERSONNEL FOR BETTER PERFORMANCE OF PWTIS

During the interviews, the respondents mentioned various issues and problems concerning the training courses conducted for various cadres of programme personnel. Simultaneously, they provided suggestions for improving the quality of training. Table 5.20 shows the detail of suggestions made by the programme personnel trained by PWTIs. Suggestions mentioned by officers, supporting staff and service providers trained by each PWTI may be provided on request.

TABLE 5.20

### SUGGESTIONS GIVEN BY THE TRAINED PROGRAMME PERSONNEL

	Suggestions	%
1	Number of participants should be small. It will provide comfortable and uninterrupted atmosphere to gain more from the training.	0.7
2	The job related refresher trainings should be arranged regularly at least once/twice/thrice/quarterly a year for all relevant categories of employees to enhance the knowledge and capacity building. The training should be arranged through out the year, not at the end of the year especially in May and June. Training should be arranged keeping in view the seasons, neither in too hot nor in too cold.	20.8
3	The course coordinators may take more interest in the arrangements to make the trainings effective and successful. PWTIs should stress on quality not quantity. There should be no more than 2 lectures a day. Training should be innovative/up to date for interest of the trainees. Trainers should fully utilize the training period. They should not waste time.	6.0
4	Training material in shape of book/brochure be compiled and provided to use/read whenever required in the field. Training handouts be improved/provided. Handouts should be relevant to the subject. Training/topic related notes/CDs be provided before training to help study the contents and enable to ask questions in the class and for future use. Library facilities in PWTIs need to be improved. Books should be provided.	4.9
5	Training must base on theory and practical demonstrations/field visits and role-play may be included to have better results. There should be training on use of medicines.	3.6
6	The resource persons should be competent/well educated for better results. Number of resource persons should be increased. Lectures should be short, relevant and comprehensive. Experienced officials from the programme be invited as source persons. Trainers should not waste time in narrating stories about personal experiences/output. Trainers should be well-educated, subject specialist and dedicated. Experienced ex-personnel of PWP be involved for training and share their experiences.	24.8
7	PWTIs should develop liaison with and share the experiences of NIPA in conducting training courses	1.6



	Suggestions	%
8	It has been observed that the employees of irrelevant field are being nominated just to complete the number of participants. It is suggested that the DPWOs or any other competent authority may be directed to send right person at the right training and PWTIs may decide and pursue for the right nominations. Only those be trained who need training or have not received relevant training earlier. Only subject related employees be called for training, after checking their educational and service record.	8.3
9	It is observed that during training in the class rooms, participants feel drowsiness, It is proposed that to keep them awake/active, small games may be played for exercise whenever feel necessary as it has been learnt that in developed countries this is a regular feature and also the question is asked to a drowsy participant. Subject related documentary films be shown.	0.7
10	The course coordinators may be imparted special training and know how on the relevant subject to conduct and coordinate training for the success of course. The Principal PWTI may watch the activities of course coordinators for better results. Principals should also show up during training.	0.7
11	PWTIs should build their own buildings with hostel facility, or trainees be allowed to make their own arrangement at fixed rates according to entitlement or current lodging system may be improved. Female trainees accompanied by their children should also be provided hotel facilities. Trainings be held in good hotels.	24.8
12	Topic must be relevant to the subject of training/contents.	5.3
13	Training should be conducted in every district office/at local level.	1.7
14	Repetition of course contents should be avoided.	2.6
15	Training must be practical. Ground realities are different from class work. Medicines and equipment be provided as per demand. Practical training on delivery be arranged in hospitals.	6.7
16	There must be pre-test and post-test in each training. Feed back from trainees be obtained and certificates be awarded to successful trainees.	4.3
17	Training duration should be increased. It should be at least two or three weeks.	12.2
18	Training duration should be short. Female trainees cannot stay out for longer period.	2.0
19	Trainers should deliver lecture in English or Urdu, according to educational level of trainees. It should be in simple Urdu language.	3.0
20	Training programme should be provided one/two week(s) earlier to the DPWOs and trainees. Training plan be communicated in the beginning of the year, just after its approval.	5.9
21	Computer training be made mandatory for all and should include practical training and its duration be increased. Also computers be provided to trainees for practice.	3.3
22	Trainers should treat the trainees properly and not to look upon them as child. They should be serious and improve their attitude. Trainers should cooperate with trainees, should not misbehave and degrade them.	2.3
23	TA/DA should be paid at the end of training as per entitlement. TA/DA rate should not be universal/fixed for all trainees or given on the sweet will of the PWTIs. It should be according to the distance traveled by trainees as per entitlement, or it should be paid in advance.	23.1
24	PWTI be shifted in RTI building to save money. PWTI be closed if don't deliver well.	0.3
25	Standard of training be improved. All old syllabuses be changed and improved.	4.0
26	There should be coordination between RTI & PWTI training programmes to avoid clash between Clinical and Non-Clinical training schedules.	0.7



	Suggestions	%
27	PWTI should provide pick-and-drop facility to trainees.	1.0
28	Training environment and facilities should be friendly.	4.0
29	Inter-net facility be arranged.	0.3
30	PWTIs should not confine to training needs of specific areas or provinces. Training venue should be changed from district to district.	2.0
31	Female trainees may not be allowed to bring their children along. It spoils the training environment. Training of females be arranged at home districts.	0.3
32	Training venue/hall should be good/according to number of trainees. Multimedia should be used during training.	2.0
33	Answer was not relevant to the question/No response.	9.6
Number		303

## **CHAPTER 6**

### **PERCEPTIONS OF TRAINED DRIVERS, NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS**

This chapter presents the perceptions of Drivers, Naib Qasids and Chowkidars trained by the PWTIs during 2002-2005. Their background characteristics, number and title of training received the extent of learning, their perceptions about the usefulness of the training received and suggested areas for future training are presented in length in the following paragraphs.

The training courses arranged for Drivers, Naib Qasids and Chowkidars included manners, etiquettes, spacing in childbirths through family planning method and driving rules etc. The trainings of these cadres were specifically arranged by the PWTI-Karachi on the request of PWDs Sindh and Balochistan.

Keeping in mind the contents of the training and duration of courses conducted for these cadres a separate module of questionnaire was designed. The main objective to interview them was to know the impact of training on their personal life as well as improvement in their behaviour and performance while dealing with higher officials.

In order to evaluate the impact of the trainings on their job and personal life, 20 respondents were selected from the list provided by PWTI-Karachi, 11 from Sindh and 9 from Balochistan. Among those 20 respondents, 9 were Drivers, 6 Naib Qasids and 5 Chowkidars.

Table 6.1 shows education level of respondents. All these personnel had minimum of primary education and maximum of B.A. Out of total, 30 percent each have either no education or have primary level education, 15 percent are F.A., 5 percent are B.A. and the rest have some attained some other technical education.



TABLE 6.1

PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF THE LEVEL OF EDUCATION OF DRIVERS,  
NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS

Level of Education	%	No.
No Education	30.0	6
Primary	30.0	6
F.A.	15.0	3
B.A.	5.0	1
Other	20.0	4
Total	100	20

## LEARNING FROM TRAINING

The respondents were asked specific questions about the learning from training, its benefits and impact on their job as well as on personal life.

When asked what they learnt from the training, 20 percent reported that they have learnt a lot about Population Welfare Programme, family planning methods, spacing of children and Islam and Family Planning, 65 percent reported that they learned etiquettes/manners i.e., how to talk with others, give protocol to officers, be responsible in performing duties, be respectful to other officers and treat them as father, 35 percent reported that they learned about traffic rules including safe driving, observance of road signals, care of engine and vehicle maintenance, engine heating and control, and 25 percent said that they were taught about punctuality, office working and office cleanliness.

## BENEFITS OF TRAINING

Benefits of training reported by trained Drivers, Naib Qasids and Chowkidars are listed in Table 6.2.

TABLE 6.2

**RESPONSES OF DRIVERS, NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS  
ABOUT BENEFITS OF TRAININGS RCIEVED**

<b>Benefits</b>	<b>No. of Drivers, Naib Qasids and Chowkidars</b>
Regularity, punctuality, etiquettes, ethics and client dealing are the qualities learned from the training. It was also learned how to behave with officers, give them respect and do not commit mistakes occurred in the past.	3
It was very useful training. Learned about contraceptive methods and ways to explain these methods to other colleges. This training motivated us to start using contraceptive methods.	8
Training was job related. Gained much knowledge about driving. Learned about responsibilities of driver. Driving rules/vehicle maintenance was explained in detail, which improved the performance and can do more careful driving. Good work pleases the officers.	8
Improved knowledge and received a Training Certificate which will help in getting job after retirement.	2
Training also provided monetary benefits i.e., TA/DA.	1
<b>Number</b>	<b>20</b>

### **IMPACT OF TRAINING ON JOB AND PERSONAL LIFE**

To assess the effectiveness of training they were asked, "Tell us some of the changes or improvement you observed after training." Their responses were recorded and presented in Table 6.3.

### **AREAS FOR FUTURE TRAINING**

Almost all the respondents were satisfied with the training provided to them and expressed that such training courses should be continued for the benefit of their colleagues. They also highlighted some of the areas that needed to be discussed in such type of trainings. Specific topics identified by them are listed below: -

1. Maintenance of vehicle, driving rules. Maintenance/repair of engine and practical training of mechanic and electrician. Repair and maintenance of cutout, battery current, plug point including knowledge about overall engine faults and repair.



2. Need more training about job and responsibilities. More training on manners/etiquettes etc.
3. Training on computer.
4. Refresher training about traffic rules and first aid.
5. Programme related training. Training required on Islam and Family Planning and how to perform duty more efficiently. Information and removal of misconceptions about Population Welfare Programme.

TABLE 6.3

PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF DRIVERS, NAIB QASIDS AND CHOWKIDARS BY THE EFFECT OF TRAINING(S) AND ON JOB AND ON PERSONAL LIFE  
(Multiple Responses)

Impact of Training on Job	%	No.
Learned driving rules, traffic rules, duties and responsibilities, which improved knowledge and became more responsible and careful driver. Learned what was not known. Training left much effect on work.	60.0	12
Learned vehicle maintenance. Now we can do minor repair ourselves.	15.0	3
Officers are happy. We show more respect to others.	20.0	4
Became active, punctual and dutiful.	10.0	2
Tell other colleagues and friends about Family Planning methods and PWP which we learned in the training.	60.0	12
<b>Impact of Training on Personal Life.</b>		
Training changed my personal attitude toward family members. It left a deep impact on personal life. Learned ethics, which solved family problems. Got knowledge about Family Planning and using Family Planning methods.	75.0	15
We learned to respect the officers and in return they respect us.	10.0	2
We became more disciplined and dutiful. We give priority to office work and then family responsibilities.	20.0	4
Training improved manners. Learned how to talk with others.	5.0	1
Availed an opportunity to go and see other places of Pakistan.	5.0	1
Number	20	

## CHAPTER 7

### PERCEPTIONS OF CURRENT TRAINEES

This chapter presents an in look of the trainees who were attending the training courses at the time of this study. Two courses were being conducted at each PWTI; (1) Basic Training for FWA and (2) Geographical Management System at PWTI-Lahore and (1) Motivation and Communication for Behavioral Change for FWA and (2) Pre-service Training for the new entrants at the PWTI-Karachi.

Five participants from each of the 4 training courses were selected for interview, and overall 10 from each PWTI were interviewed. The trainees on the spot were asked almost same kind of questions that were asked to the previously trained personnel. Further details of trainees are demonstrated in Table 7.1.

TABLE 7.1  
NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND CADER

	Officers	Supporting Staff	Service Provider	Total
PWTI-LAHORE	0	6	4	10
PWTI-KARACHI	4	0	6	10
<b>Total</b>	4	6	10	20

The distribution of these cadres by designation is given in Table 7.2. The officers included two ADPWOs, one TPWO, MO and Senior Instructor each. Supporting Staff included six Assistants and Service Providers included one FWC, five FWA (Male) and three FWA (Female).



**TABLE 7.2**  
**NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND BY DESIGNATION**

Designation	PWTI-Lahore	PWTI-Karachi
ADPWO	0	2
TPWO	0	1
MEDICAL OFFICER	0	1
SENIOR INSTRUCTOR	0	1
ASSISTANT	6	0
FWC	0	1
FWA (Male)	4	1
FWA (Female)	0	3
<b>Total</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>

### NUMBER OF TRAININGS RECEIVED

On the-spot-training participants were asked about the number of trainings they had received previously. Overall 12 out of 20 personnel had already received training from the PWTIs. One training course was attended by four programme personnel, two courses by two personnel, three courses by four personnel and four training courses by two personnel.

Most of the courses attended by these personnel were on family planning methods, awareness, counseling, motivation, contraceptive logistics, office procedures, office management, financial management, IEC, MIS, computer training and training for master trainees of Male Mobilizers.

**TABLE 7.3**  
**NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI, CADER AND BY**  
**NUMBER OF TRAININGS PREVIOUSLY RECEIVED**

	Number of Training Previously Received				Total
	1	2	3	4	
<b>PWTI-LAHORE</b>					
Officers	0	0	0	0	0
Supporting Staff	2	1	2	0	5
Service Provider	0	0	0	0	0
<b>PWTI-KARACHI</b>					
Officers	0	1	0	2	3
Supporting Staff	0	0	0	0	0
Service Provider	2	0	2	0	4
<b>Total</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>12</b>

## PERCEPTIONS ABOUT TRAINING

During the course of this study, all the programme personnel currently receiving training were asked various questions to evaluate the effectiveness of training. Information collected on the basis of their responses is presented in Table 7.4. which shows the extent of learning; eleven reported learning a lot from this training; five learnt to some extent, two reported adequate learning and one each learnt little and very little.

Responding about the methodology used during training, majority of trainees (14) reported that both approaches i.e. lecture oriented as well as participatory were used. Ten participants were of the opinion that presentation of lecture was excellent; eight said it was very good and two reported it as good. Among all trainees fourteen expressed that knowledge of presenters was very effective while six of them reported it was good.

Overall presentation of lectures, organization of sessions and creating pleasant environment were reported as good by majority of the respondents. This shows the effectiveness and better performance of PWTIs. More than fifty percent of the respondents reported that duration of training was just right.



**TABLE 7.4**  
**NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND THEIR VIEWS ABOUT TRAINING**

	PWTI-Lahore	PWTI-Karachi	Total
<b>Extent of Learning</b>			
Very Little	1	0	1
Little	0	1	1
To Some Extent	1	4	5
Adequate	1	1	2
A lot	7	4	11
<b>Methodology of Training</b>			
Lecture Oriented	2	0	2
Participatory	1	3	4
Both	7	7	14
<b>Presentation of Lectures</b>			
Good	0	2	2
Very Good	2	6	8
Excellent	8	2	10
<b>Knowledge of the Presenters</b>			
Good	2	4	6
Very Effective	8	6	14
<b>Organization of the Session</b>			
Good	4	7	11
Very Effective	6	3	9
<b>Presentation of the Lecture</b>			
Good	7	8	15
Very Effective	3	2	5
<b>Responsiveness to Group</b>			
Good	2	8	10
Very Effective	8	2	10
<b>Good Learning Environment</b>			
Good	4	8	12
Very Effective	6	2	8
<b>Duration of the Training</b>			
Too Short	7	1	8
Just Right	3	8	11
Too Long	0	1	1
<b>Total</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>20</b>

## USEFULNESS OF THE TRAINING

This study tried to assess the utility of training programmes conducted by PWTIs. In this regard number of questions was asked, whether or not the training courses have

explained the objectives and policies of Population Welfare Programme. Information on additional training needs was also captured from this study. Details are presented in Table 7.5.

It is very encouraging to note that all participants of on-the-spot training reported that training provided by both the PWTIs is very relevant and useful for their jobs. Eighteen out of twenty trainees viewed this training had explained the objectives and policies of Population Welfare Programme. Almost all of them expressed their feelings that they would recommend others to attend this type of trainings, since each programme employee would like to refresh knowledge that enhances the productivity. About nineteen out of twenty trainees showed interest to have additional training from a PWTI, which shows the credibility of PWTIs and usefulness of the training courses.

**TABLE 7.5**  
**NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND THEIR**  
**VIEWS ABOUT USEFULNESS OF TRAININGS**

	PWTI-Lahore	PWTI-Karachi	Total
<b>Training Translated the Objectives and Policies of the PWP</b>			
Yes	9	9	18
No	1	1	2
<b>Was the Training relevant to the Job</b>			
Yes	10	10	20
No	0	0	0
<b>Was the Training useful to the Work</b>			
Yes	10	10	20
No	0	0	0
<b>Need Additional Training</b>			
Yes	9	10	19
No	1	0	1
<b>Recommend others for similar Training</b>			
Yes	10	10	20
No	0	0	0



## PERCEPTIONS ABOUT FACILITIES

Training environment, facilities and arrangement play positive role in learning process. This study tried to assess the learning environment during the training courses conducted by PWTIs. Ten out of twenty said that audio-visual equipments used during training were excellent whereas four of them reported as very good and six said the were just good (Table 7.6).

While responding about the training arrangements, training venue and services during training, generally it was reported good, very good or excellent. None reported any dissatisfaction in any case.

The analysis shows that on the whole the personnel who had received or were being trained at the time of first study survey were more than satisfied from the performance of the PWTIs and want such training programmes to be continued for the capacity building of the programme personnel.

**TABLE 7.6**  
**NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND THEIR VIEWS**  
**ABOUT FACILITIES DURING TRAINING**

	PWTI-Lahore	PWTI-Karachi	Total
<b>Visual Aids</b>			
Good	1	5	6
Very Good	1	3	4
Excellent	8	2	10
<b>Training arrangement</b>			
Good	1	3	4
Very Good	1	5	6
Excellent	8	2	10
<b>Services during Training</b>			
Good	2	4	6
Very Good	3	5	8
Excellent	5	1	6
<b>Training Venue</b>			
Good	2	4	6
Very Good	1	5	6
Excellent	7	1	8
<b>Total</b>	10	10	20

## SUGGESTIONS

The suggestions made by on-the-spot trainees are presented in Table 7.7 below:

**TABLE 7.7**  
**NUMBER OF CURRENT TRAINEES BY PWTI AND THEIR**  
**SUGGESTIONS FOR THE IMPROVEMENT OF PWTIs**

	Suggestions	PWTI-Lahore	PWTI-Karachi	Total
1	They should invite people from DG offices to explain about reporting. There should be more involvement of retired officials to deliver lecture at PWTI.	1	2	3
2	Schedule should be intimated in time. Mostly participants are informed very late, only one day before. Participants should be informed at least one week before the training starts.	1	1	2
3	Promotion criteria i.e. seniority should be followed.	1	0	1
4	Training should be job related. Refresher training for each cadre be arranged at least once a year.	1	1	2
5	Duration of training should be at least 2 weeks.	4	1	5
6	Better hotel accommodation should be provided i.e. only two people in one room. Facilities at training and at hotel are not good. PWTI should take care of the trainees.	1	1	2
7	PWTI should arrange pre-service training at PWTI. Their instructors are better than NIPA's instructors.	0	1	1
8	PWTI should start lecture/training programme on demography and population studies.	1	0	1
9	Involve more religious people and invite them in training.	1	0	1
10	The resource persons of this training are very good and should also be invited in future training.	1	0	1
11	Females be allowed to bring the infant and very small kids with them and also attendants at their own expenses. Participants be also allowed to stay at the hotel of their own choice.	0	2	2
12	TA/DA should be increased and given in time.	0	2	2
13	Women participants from Balochistan should be allowed to bring someone with them (Mother, Sister, Brother and Father) because it is very difficult to travel alone. Or training be given at their own districts so that they should not come at Karachi.	0	2	2
14	More lectures should be on our population programme, its working, planning and missions.	0	1	1
15	Trainers should also be given training for good delivery of lectures.	0	1	1
16	For long training some advance should be given.	0	2	2
17	Principal of PWTI should also visit NIPA if the training is organized there. More facilities should be given to the participants of pre-service training.	0	2	2
18	No suggestions because training has no weakness. It was very good training.	4	2	6
	<b>Total</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>20</b>





## CHAPTER 8

### PERCEPTIONS OF DISTRICT POPULATION WELFARE OFFICERS

This chapter presents an overview of the perceptions of District Population Welfare Officers (DPWO) about the non-clinical training provided by the PWTIs and suggested areas to improve training courses for the capacity building of their employees.

The main function of the DPWO is to help create an environment supportive to population welfare activities in the district and monitor the activities in the respective districts. For the capacity building of the employees of PWD, non-clinical training is very helpful in performing of their duties and motivating a common man about the small family norms.

During this study, District Officers were inquired about their involvement in the processes of non-clinical training. They were asked specific questions such as “Have you ever been asked by the PWD or PWTI to assess the training needs of your staff?” “Have you ever assessed the district training needs and communicated to the PWD/PWTI?” “Were your suggested training programme(s) arranged by the PWD/PWTI?” and “Did you see any improvement in the performance of employees who received training?” Data collected from the study show that a total of 87 district officers were interviewed, 29 officers from Punjab, 16 from Sindh, 24 from NWFP, 16 from Balochistan and 2 from AJK (Table 8.1).

**TABLE 8.1**  
**NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO HAVE EVER BEEN ASKED TO**  
**ASSESS THE TRAINING NEEDS OF THEIR STAFF**

Province	Yes	No	Total
Punjab	6	23	29
Sindh	11	5	16
NWFP	20	4	24
Balochistan	7	9	16
AJK	0	2	2
Total	44	43	87



Among DPWOs who were interviewed, 44 reported that they were asked for the need assessment of their staff whereas 43 DPWO reported that they have never been asked for such assessment. Regarding need assessment and bringing it to the notice of PWD or Ministry of Population Welfare (Table 8.2), 61 DPWOs expressed their views that the need assessment was done and communicated to the higher level for implementation, comprising of 18 from Punjab, 12 from Sindh, 21 from NWFP and 10 from Balochistan.

**TABLE 8.2**  
**NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO EVER ASSESSED THE TRAINING NEEDS**  
**OF THEIR STAFF AND COMMUNICATED TO THE MoPW**

Province	Yes	No	Total
Punjab	18	11	29
Sindh	12	4	16
NWFP	21	3	24
Balochistan	10	6	16
AJK	0	2	2
<b>Total</b>	<b>61</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>87</b>

Table 8.3 shows that among 87 district officers, a total of 56 indicated that the training courses suggested by them were arranged whereas 31 reported that such trainings were not arranged.

**TABLE 8.3**  
**NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO REPORTED THAT SUGGESTED**  
**TRAINING COURSES WERE ARRANGED**

Province	Yes	No	Total
Punjab	22	7	29
Sindh	10	6	16
NWFP	16	8	24
Balochistan	6	10	16
AJK	2	0	2
<b>Total</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>31</b>	<b>87</b>

The respondents were further inquired whether they kept record of the trainings of their staff. About 93 percent officers gave positive response whereas 7 percent officers did not think it was necessary to keep such record.

This study further shows that about 77 officers out of 87 (Table 8.4) perceived that the training was helpful in improving the performance of their employees. They observed major difference between the functioning of trained and untrained employees. Among 77 officers, 23 officers were from Punjab, 13 from Sindh, 23 from NWFP, 16 from Balochistan and 2 from AJK.

**TABLE 8.4**  
**NUMBER OF DPWOs WHO OBSERVED IMPROVEMENT**  
**IN THE PERFORMANCE OF TRAINED STAFF**

Province	Yes	No	Total
Punjab	23	6	29
Sindh	13	3	16
NWFP	23	1	24
Balochistan	16	0	16
AJK	2	0	2
Total	77	10	87

## SUGGESTIONS

Table 8.5 indicates the areas of training suggested by the DPWOs that are needed for their employees and Table 8.6 demonstrates the suggestions made by them for improving the performance of PWTIs.

**TABLE 8.5**  
**PERCENTAGES OF DPWOs WITH REPORTED AREAS OF TRAINING**  
**REQUIRED FOR THEIR STAFF**  
(Multiple Responses)

	Type of Training Required	Total	
		%	Number
1	Job related training.	41.4	36
2	Training of senior FWCs as FTOs.	35.6	31
3	Basic as well as advance computer training.	100	19
4	FWWs may be provided more technical instead of theoretical training.	16.1	16
5	Office Management and administration for Officers and Field Staff.	16.1	14
6	Motivation, mobilization and counseling skills.	16.1	14
7	Record keeping and Report writing.	13.8	12



	Type of Training Required	Total	
		%	Number
8	Account, Financial Rules and Regulations.	13.8	12
9	Logistic System.	5.7	5
10	Concept of CYP, Registration of eligible couples, new methods of contraceptives, sterilization, AIDS, RTIs and STDs.	1.1	1
11	Marketing and skills development for field staff.	2.3	2
12	Advocacy, Behavioural change and Communication skill development.	3.4	3
13	Monitoring and Evaluation.	1.1	1
14	Reproductive Health.	3.4	3
15	Pre-service training.	1.1	1
16	Management Information System (MIS).	2.3	2
	<b>Total</b>	87	

TABLE 8.6

**PERCENTAGE OF DPWOs WITH SUGGESTED WAYS TO IMPROVE THE  
PERFORMANCE OF PWTIs**

	Suggestions	Total	
		%	Number
1	Trainers should focus on the training subject and avoid repetition of contents under different titles of training. Trainings should aim not on achieving target but on the purpose of training to achieve desired low birth rate. Trainings should be subjective and job related/need-based.	33.3	29
2	The trainers from one PWTI should provide trainings in other provinces, which will enhance friendship and harmony.	26.4	23
3	PWTI should also arrange trainings at district level for benefit of all district employees, public representatives/Ulemas/teachers/Health workers etc. Trainings should be a regular feature and be arranged after specified intervals. Frequency of trainings be increased and should be more practical instead of theoretical. Trainings should be refresher type in which participants should learn how to cope with practical/technical problems.	21.8	19
4	PWTIs should circulate their training schedule in the beginning of the year to facilitate the DPWOs for sending nominations well in time. DPWO and trainees must be informed at least two weeks before commencement of training. Training schedule is received late, sometimes a day before commencement of training. It is not possible to call nominees from far off areas, so training schedule and nominations should be finalized/provided well in advance. DPWOs/PWDs should ensure availability of staff for training.	20.7	18
5	Syllabus/training contents may be improved/revised and updated to meet the requirement/ground realities. Subjects like programme promotional pre-service basic training, advance training, demography.	17.2	15



	Suggestions	Total	
		%	Number
	computer literacy, finance, RH etc. be made part of all trainings for all employees. Subjects of training should not be repeated. PWTI needs to be made a productive training institute and add new subjects. PWTI officials should be sincere and be confined to course contents.		
6	TA/DA should be increased and must be paid according to trainees' cadre/entitlement as per rules and well in time after the training.	16.1	14
7	High quality/well educated/trained instructors should be arranged. They should focus on related subject having ample knowledge of the subject/basic concepts of PWP and also have unanimity of views. Programme-own experienced officials, be invited as trainers/teachers.	16.1	14
8	PWTIs should have better liaison and coordination with DPWO. There is lack of coordination between DPWOs and PWTIs. No record of trainees is maintained at the PWTIs and at the Districts. Therefore some officials proceed on training frequently. PWTIs should invite trainees through their respective DPWOs who may not nominate any employee again and again. Nomination should base on performance and personal observation. PWTI should also keep record of all trainees and number of trainees should not exceed 20-25.	14.9	13
9	Training venue/hall may be improved, transport facility may also be provided to trainees. PWTI's overall training environment methodology/standard/living conditions etc. should be improved. PWTIs should have their own buildings/hostels. Female trainees be provided separate accommodation. Trainees be allowed to make their own hotel arrangement as per entitlement and convenience.	14.9	13
10	Training tools should be made available and well trained/qualified resource persons/subject specialists should be arranged to raise the overall standard of training.	11.5	10
11	Short field trips for practical experience may be arranged for trainees to learn about working environment in the service outlets/other institutes/offices like Pak Steel Mills, Civil Secretariat, Audit and Accounts Department etc. Recreation trips be also made part of training schedule.	9.2	8
12	Training plan of PWTIs should be prepared in consultation with all field officers (DPWOs), since they have vast fieldwork and practical experience of field difficulties.	5.7	5
13	Subject related & expert trainers/resource persons from other than Population Welfare Department/Programme like NIPA and S&GD department should also be invited for training.	6.9	6
14	DPWOs should also be invited to deliver lecture to field staff. They should be invited to attend the training of their field staff to discuss/resolve issues/problems faced by them. They may further be provided refresher trainings to enhance their capacity building.	5.7	5
15	PWTIs should conduct post-training tests and share the result with concerned DPWOs. Training should yield positive results viz reduction in population growth rate.	5.7	5
16	The training activities should be undertaken through out the year instead of conducting trainings in the last quarter/month of the year just to utilize and balance the training budget allocation. This practice should be changed. PWTIs remain idle for rest of the year.	5.7	5
17	PWTI should assess its own output. Pre and post training performance of PWTI should be assessed/compared.	4.6	4



	Suggestions	Total	
		%	Number
18	Only those officers/officials from a specific cadre should be called to attend a training for which that training is being arranged.	3.4	3
19	The training duration should be for 2-4 weeks. Daily training time should be from 8 a.m to 2 p.m and PWTIs must provide relevant hand-outs/print material/CD before/during the training for future use. Trainings should not be arranged in too hot and too cold seasons. Area/venue climate/environment be kept in view.	3.4	3
20	PWTIs should get feed back from DPWOs when the field trainees are back on duty.	2.3	2
21	Trainings should stress on quality instead of quantity.	3.4	3
22	NIPA and Pakistan Institute of Management (PIM) may be involved in preparation of training programmes for the officers. PWTI should study/adopted training system of NIPA.	2.3	2
23	Trainers should be well behaved. They should not discourage questions and arguments from the trainees. They should be friendly towards the participants. Instructors may further be trained/groomed and provided foreign training to build their capacity. Suggestions of participants at the end of training should be taken seriously/implemented.	2.3	2
Total		87	

## **CHAPTER 9**

### **PERCEPTIONS OF PROVINCIAL DIRECTORS AND HIGHER OFFICERS**

This chapter presents information collected from provincial Director Generals, Secretaries, Deputy Secretaries, Directors and other senior officials involved in the human development processes of provincial employees. In this regard twenty-two higher-level officials were contacted for interview from four provinces, which included 6 from Punjab, 5 from Sindh, 3 from Balochistan and 8 from NWFP. Unfortunately four officers from NWFP could not spare time due to other engagements. Therefore, 18 interviews were successfully completed. Their views and perceptions have been recorded and are presented here.

#### **INVOLVEMENT OF PROVINCIAL DEPARTMENTS IN THE PREPARATION OF ANNUAL TRAINING PLAN OF THE PWTIS**

An attempt was made to assess the involvement of all relevant departments in designing and preparation of training plan for the capacity building of programme personnel.

Majority of the respondents/officials expressed that designing of Annual Training Plan is done by participatory consultative process, but involvement of each tier is not given equal representation. Three officers did not respond because two of them were not directly involved and one officer was recently posted. The perceptions of officers are presented below:

“The training needs of the employees are assessed to meet the demand of PWTI. In the provincial office the training plan is prepared through a consultative process. The suggestions and proposals of district officers are also considered before preparation of training plan. The training plan is submitted to the PWTI for approval and its incorporation in the overall national training programme. The trainings proposed in the plan are usually accepted with certain changes if required so. The training plan proposal of the PWD is incorporated and followed by the PWTI”.

**(Dy. Director, IEC, Punjab)**



“Population Department is fully involved in the preparation of training plan. PWTIs ask the department about the training needs of its employees. Training requirement of employees is checked through a consultative process. The training requirement of the PWD are considered by PWTI and made part of the overall training plan. Before preparation of training plan in the PWD, the field officers i.e. DPWOs are also involved in this process and they submit training requirement of field staff. However the suggestions of the field officers are just considered and are not incorporated in the draft plan. The PWTI follows its own training schedule as contained in the plan”.

**(Director Finance, Punjab)**

“Meetings are held to discuss and finalize the training requirement of the provincial employees. On completion and finalization, the training plan is sent to the Ministry for approval. The proposed training requirements are discussed with concerned officers in the Ministry for its finalization/approval. However funds available for training activities were not properly used due to non-recruitment of staff. There is no practice to involve DPWOs in formulation of training plan. Field Officers are often appointed on reference (sifarish). They do not do what they are supposed to do. The trainings arranged by PWTI are usually those as laid down in the training plan”.

**(Deputy Secretary, Planning, Sindh)**

“The training plan is prepared through a consultative process and fully shared with the PWTI. The PWD makes assessment of training needs of the employees. The suggestions of the provincial office are considered by the PWTI before incorporation in the training plan. However, the DPWOs are not at any stage, supposed to forward training need requirements of their field staff, that is why neither their suggestions are recorded nor the question to incorporate and arrange such trainings arises”.

**(Additional Secretary, Sindh)**

“The training plan is prepared by PWD and shared with PWTI & MoPW. MoPW asks PWD to prepare annual training plan. PWD officers prepare plan and then discuss with Secretary PWD. Usually the training plan requirements sent by PWD to MoPW are shared with PWTI and they mutually discuss and forward it to PWD. Again PWD shares it with them before giving it a final shape. PWDs are not involved in preparing training requirement. The training plan is finalized between MoPW, PWTI and PWD”.

**(Secretary, PWD, Balochistan)**

“Do not know since working/posting as DG for the last six months. Preparation/sharing of training Plan has been the responsibility of Deputy Director (M & E) as she(DG) has previously been working as Director

(Tech) in PWD and dealing with technical training of employees. While preparing current Training Plan (2006-07), Director (TC), Mr. Shafqat of MoPW visited PWD. The other information is available with concerned officer of PWD, i.e. DD (M & E)".

**(Director General, PWD, Balochistan)**

Analysis of the responses clearly shows that most of the officers are neither directly involved nor are aware about the channel of initiation of training plan, whether it is the Ministry, the PWD or the PWTI to initiate the Annual Training Plan.

It is also indicated from the analysis that field officers (DPWO) are not consulted for the need requirement of their employees.

### **TRAINING NEED ASSESSMENT BY PWDS FOR VARIOUS CADRES OF EMPLOYEES**

Need assessment for the employees at each level and for each cadre is very important. All concerned officers from the provinces were asked about the usual practice regarding this activity. Some of the responses are presented below:

"The PWD has never assessed the training needs. PWTI should arrange training courses on monitoring, computer literacy and financial management for provincial HQ employees. Similarly the district level employees need to be trained in financial management, record keeping and supervisory role for supervision and control of field staff".

**(Director, PME, Punjab)**

"PWD has never assessed the training needs for different cadres of employees. Provincial level employees need training in the fields of Accounts, Administration and Monitoring while the district level staff should be provided job specific trainings, like communication, accounts, advocacy etc".

**(Deputy Director, Planning, Punjab)**

"As a practice the provincial office does not fully assess the training needs. When PWTI asks for nominations, those who have not received training before are nominated. Field staff needs training on devolution plan of Government, financial management including budget and rules and skill development. The PWTI staff/instructors also require training including foreign training to enhance their capacity building".

**(Deputy Secretary, Planning, Sindh)**



“This year the PWD assessed the training needs whereas there was no such assessment at district level. The provincial employees need training in the fields of provincial rules/laws and regulations, financial management and rules, with details because the concerned staff does not even know difference between total financial requirement and head-wise requirement of each activity, and administration, including delegation of powers of various cadres of officers. The district level staff requires training especially in the field of financial management and accounts”.

**(Deputy Secretary, Finance, Sindh)**

“The Population Department has never assessed the training needs of its employees. The employees require training in the field of financial management, administrative rules and regulations, communication skill, interpersonal communication, spontaneous decision-making, computer literacy, use of multimedia and presentation skill etc”.

**(Additional, Secretary, Sindh)**

“The training needs are assessed through consultative meetings. Last meeting was held in March s2006. Provincial employees need training in Office Management, Service Rules and Regulations. District staff may be provided refresher courses on communication and counseling techniques”.

**(Director General, PWD, Balochistan)**

“Assessment of training needs for employees at provincial and district levels was carried out during April/May, 2006. Provincial employees be trained in computer literacy, communication/Daftri Urdu, office management etc. District staff should be trained in computer literacy, training of trainers for male mobilizers”.

**(Director (M & E), NWFP)**

“A provincial trainings need of employees of various cadres was assessed in May, 2006. Training was imparted how the countries like Egypt, Bangladesh, and Malaysia successfully implemented the population control policy. The same training may also be imparted to officers at district level. Officers at district and provincial level may share it with field staff at districts”.

**(Deputy Director (PC & T), NWFP)**

## **NOMINATION CRITERIA FOR TRAINING OF PROVINCIAL EMPLOYEES**

Analysis of the responses reveals that no systematic procedure is in place for nominating an officer for training. In principal seniority is the basic criteria to be followed. Procedures prevailing in the provinces described by various officers are presented below: -

“The Secretary, PWD nominates the officers in grade 17 and above while the rest of the employees up to grade 16 are nominated by the DG. Those who have not received training are given preference for selecting nominees, and sometimes the training need of an employee is assessed to some extent. However there is no practice to assess weakness or strength of any employees before one's nomination for training”.

**(Director (PME), Punjab)**

“Nominations for training in PWTI are made on seniority basis only. Neither training need of an employee nor the weakness/strength of an official is the criteria for nomination”.

**(Director, Finance, Punjab)**

“Nominations are sent by the Secretary's office and the gazetted officers nominate themselves. They ask for nomination of others from the PWD. The criteria for selection and nomination are that the nominees should not have received training during the last three years”.

**(Deputy Director (Planning), Punjab)**

“There is no criteria regarding nomination of employees for training. Who ever is available is nominated for training because the department is short of staff. Sometimes an employee is nominated on choice or request because he/she wants a tour to solve some personal problem on the expenses of training”.

**(Deputy Secretary, Finance, Punjab)**

“The Training Section forwards the nominations for training to the Secretary for approval. The selection is performance based not the need-based. Mostly those who are active and energetic are nominated. Furthermore, the weakness, strength as well as working capacity of the nominee is also considered before nominations.

**(Deputy Secretary, Sindh)**

“As a practice the provincial officials sometimes nominate the employees for training and sometimes the provincial PWD asks the district population officers to forward nominations. The main criteria followed is that those employees are nominated for training who have not received any training



during the last two years. I think there is no practice to assess the weakness and strength of the employees while submitting nominations for trainings”.

**(Additional Secretary, Sindh)**

“Nominations are proposed/referred through consultative process. The nominations are proposed on need-assessment basis, keeping in view the employees requirement/strength and weakness.”

**(Deputy Director (M & E), Balochistan)**

“Provincial DG is responsible to nominate employees for training. Trainees are selected on the basis of seniority and those employees who have not received such training in the past- on rotation basis. Training need of each employee is considered before nomination and weak areas of employees are assessed before submission of nominations”.

**(Secretary, PWD, Balochistan)**

“PME section recommends the employees for training while Director General/Secretary PWD approves it.”

**(Deputy Director (PC & T), NWFP)**

“The employees are nominated by concerned districts and finally approved and forwarded by DG through concerned Directors. Training needs are assessed and forwarded for job specific training. The weaknesses and strengths/capacity of employees are also assessed before nominating for training course”.

**(Director (Tech), NWFP)**

## **ASSESSMENT OF THE TRAINING PROGRAMMES OF PWTIS**

Most of the officials have observed considerable improvement in the performance of their employees who received training from PWTI as compared to those who did not receive training. However, some of them could not comment on this question because they had never received any at PWTI.

Majority of the respondents were satisfied with the training courses arranged by PWTIs. They thought the training courses arranged by PWTI were useful, innovative, and informative to bring change in the role-play and performance of the trained personnel. Training provided at PWTIs is very useful to enhance the skills of programme employees and trained employees show better performance than the un-trained.

Some of the officers had different view point about training programmes. pinpointed certain weaknesses and suggested some improvements as:

“The training programmes are sometimes repetitions and sometimes new. The trainings are useful to some extent but need improvement. Mostly the trainings are refresher and they arrange guest speakers who create novelty in their lectures. PWTI needs to improve itself. We are far behind from the rest of the world; we are still talking about financial management issues. The trainings’ overall effect is little, their own IQ and abilities make the difference.”

**(Deputy Secretary, Sindh)**

“The training programmes arranged by the PWTI are not satisfactory. The trainings arranged in/with NIPA are usually good and the trainings arranged by PWTI are not good. It is because the PWTI staff is not well trained and the participants are also not very interested. PWTI is not independent in conducting trainings. Their budget is limited and have to arrange trainings within limits and under government rules”.

**(Deputy Secretary, Planning, Sindh)**

“The overall training programmes of PWTI are very good and I am satisfied”.

**(Additional Secretary, Sindh)**

“The trainings are fruitful and help to enhance knowledge. However, the PWTI should prepare a well thought of training schedule so that there is no clash between various trainings. Usually it is realized that output/performance enhances to some extent after receiving a specific training from PWTI”.

**(Deputy Director (M & E), Balochistan)**

## **THE LEVEL OF SATISFACTION OF FACILITIES**

Most of the higher officials could not respond to the question about the level of satisfaction of the facilities at PWTIs and at the training venue because they have never been to the premises of PWTIs or in the training.

Majority of the respondents thought the facilities at PWTIs and training venue were good and satisfactory as per the needs of the training. However, some of them have viewed it other way round and expressed their feelings as:-

“The overall level of facilities should be enhanced. The strength of staff in the PWTI should be increased so that they could arrange trainings at district level. Trainers should be previewed incentives, and training environment is always good”.

**(Deputy District Administration General, Punjab)**



“There is need to improve the facilities as the training venue. Similarly the hotel accommodation that is made available is not good and the training hall is also not proper. Participants take keen interest, the training arrangement need improvement. The resource persons are found well-informed”.

**(Director, Finance, Punjab)**

“The training venue/hall is not according to need when there are large number of trainees. The PWTI should offer choice to trainees whether they stay in the hotel arranged by them or by the PWTI. Do not know about incentives to trainers who are employees of PWTI. However resource persons invited from other institutes/offices are paid extra amount. The overall training environment is satisfactory”.

**(Deputy Director (M & E), Balochistan)**

“I am not fully satisfied with the overall facilities provided during training. They allow two officers in one room and the training environment is good”.

**(Additional Secretary, Sindh)**

## **WEAKNESSES**

Most of the respondents did not answer to the question about the weak areas of PWTI. Some of them did not observe any weakness in the institutes. However some of the weaknesses reported are as under:

“Staff requires improvement of skills and capacity building. The staff strength should be increased. Teaching staff should be well trained, and foreign qualified”.

**(Dy. Director Planning, Punjab)**

“Trainings not provided on service rules, there is no collaboration, no awareness about technical side and resource persons lack clear objective of the training course”.

**(Deputy District Administration General, Punjab)**

“PWTI should have its own building, with enough class rooms, training hall, accommodation, facility of multimedia, networking, computer training arrangement in computer lab, Internet facility. For capacity building, the trainees should be trained in specific area. The senior officers should also deliver lectures. The right man should be at the right place. Doctors are working in the warehouse. “

**(Deputy Secretary, Sindh)**

“The weakness of PWTI, in my view include lack of decision making and weak management. They just consider the quantity and quorum and sometimes the people do not come in training”.

(Additional Secretary, Sindh)

“PWTI sends intimation letter just before commencement of training. It becomes difficult to inform the trainees. Accommodation is not satisfactory and it’s difficult to get TA/DA. The instructors are also not fully trained and resource persons should be of high standard. They should be subject specialists”.

(Deputy Secretary, Sindh)

“The major weakness as I experienced is that the instructors are not well trained and equipped in respective fields”.

(Additional Secretary, Sindh)

“Shortage of trainers/instructors. Training venue/hall is not very spacious. Individual microphone system not available for the trainees. For computer training, the PWTI has no computer lab/facility for trainees”.

(Deputy Director (M & E), Balochistan)

“Its long distance to Lahore. The staff specially females usually refuse training due to the fact that they cannot leave their duty stations and home for training”.

(Director (Tech), NWFP)

## SUGGESTIONS TO IMPROVE THE PERFORMANCE OF PWTIS

Almost all the respondents gave more than one suggestion for improving the working of PWTIs. The suggestions made are compiled and presented province-wise.

### PROVINCE

### SUGGESTIONS

#### Punjab

- ♣ Training manual should be revised and updated to meet the current situation and needs. The PWTI should have its own building with hostel facility. Evaluation of PWTI itself should be a regular on going process on yearly basis.
- ♣ PWTI should facilitate the PWD in training need assessment process. PWTI should discuss and provide guidance to prepare training plan and then circulate their schedule. PWTI should provide on-the-job training. There should be a close coordination between concerned officials in the training wing/section of the PWD and the PWTI.



- ♣ PWTI should have its own building, library, and computer lab, a big training hall. PWTI may use lecture hall in Ganga Ram Hospital, which appears to be far better than the training hall in the Crown Plaza Hotel usually arranged by PWTI for training propose. The existing PWTI staff should keep up-dating their knowledge and wherever needed fresh staff should be recruited. Computer training should be mandatory for all employees. PWTI should develop its web site and put all training programmes and activities on web for benefit of the employees in particular and the common people in general. PWTI should compile its training activities and circulate for information of all. Need-assessment of training and communication skill development of the employees particularly should be a regular feature.
- ♣ The PWTI should call suggestions from trainees in time and their suggestions should be incorporated. The training calendar should be circulated well in time to invite comments/suggestions and the finalized calendar should be circulated.
- ♣ Faculty members should be regular/punctual, well equipped and foreign trained.
- ♣ Vacant posts in PWTI should be filled. They should arrange guest speakers to make the training programme more useful. Foreign training facility should also be provided. They should be invited to various seminars to improve their teaching methodology. They should compete at international level.
- ♣ PWTI faculty need to be provided in-country as well as foreign training to increase their capacity building. There should be decentralization of powers of PWTI staff. Principal alone should not be responsible for all matters/things required for arranging petty work like purchase of stationary, arrangement of hotel facilities for the trainees etc. It should be the responsibility of staff including instructors.
- ♣ It is suggested that training sessions for DPWOs should be for 3 days because they cannot be spared for a week or more. The resource persons should be knowledgeable.
- ♣ Trainers should be skilled and subject specialists in their fields/subjects of training; PWTI must arrange proper accommodation/hotel and funds for TA/DA before commencement of training; there should be no trainings in the holy month of Ramzan and in very hot weather. The number of trainers/instructors should be more than one, so that the trainees do not get bored; there should be different trainers for different

**Sindh**

titles/topics of training; late coming participants for one/two day(s) should be debarred from attending the training because all such trainees come for earning and not for learning.

- ♣ Instructors should be well trained to meet the challenges and new techniques and information in their lectures. They may be provided foreign trainings. The PWTI should revise their course and training contents for further improvement. DPWOs should also be involved in the process of preparation of training plans. The field officers should nominate employees for training in PWTI because they better know who needs training.

#### NWFP

- There should be no duplication of different subjects covered in clinical training and Non-clinical training. RTI should cater for all technical aspects and PWTI should impart training on non-technical topics only.
- ♣ The PWTIs may form panels of professional instructors/experts to be drawn from within PWTIs, or visiting instructors from other training institutes, the MoPW itself and the provincial PWDs. Their selection should be based on qualification and experience in respective field of training. PWTIs should be quality-training institutions. Training sessions should be conducted as learning as well as cultural exchange programme. Syllabus may be updated and made more simple and realistic having linkage with the subject of training and avoid buzz. Training should be job related and only concerned officials should be invited for training.
- ♣ As per her experiences, she faced no problem and the training was quite satisfactory. The officers offered no comments on suggestions.
- ♣ Every province should have one PWTI. Each PWTI must build its own building for training as well as residential purpose of the trainees. State of the art technology like multimedia and projectors should be used during the training. At least once in a year, resource person may be invited from countries like Egypt, Turkey, and Malaysia. These countries have successfully implemented the FP programme in a shorter period of time.
- ♣ Trainings should also include topics such as STI, RTIs, etc.



## **Balochistan**

- The PWTI should finalize its training schedule/calendar well in time before training so that employees could be spared. Sometimes there is clash between training schedules of PWTI and clinical training. Therefore the concerned quarters in the MoPW (i.e. Training Date and CT Date) should mutually settle the training schedules of PWTIs and RTIs. The PWTI should inform about the trainees to PWD who have participated in the training. The number of instructors/trainers may be increased so they could perform efficiently. Reference material about training should be provided.
- ♣ The PWTIs are very productive and are trying to provide required trainings. The faculty staff should improve their skills and knowledge keeping in view the requirement of each training. The PWTIs should train their own faculty to act as Master Trainers.
- ♣ The employees from Balochistan should also be trained at PWTI, Lahore. The PWTI should arrange trainings through out the year instead of arranging in the 3rd or 4th quarter of the year. The PWTI, Karachi should pay TA/DA to the trainees just after completion of training. There should be monitoring mechanism to oversee the activities of PWTI. The MoPW should monitor all training activities of PWTI. There should be some officer responsible for timely disbursement of TA/DA and provision of other facilities. Delay in release of funds to the PWTI may be the reason that the PWTI arranges more training in the 3rd and 4th quarter.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

- PWTIs are conducting non-clinical training programmes for the planners, managers and other professionals of Population Welfare Programme. As such main focus of capacity building should be to fully prepare the trainers so that they are able to improve the programme in their respective fields and districts at par with developed countries or at least to the level of some developing countries like Sri Lanka, Iran, Turkey, Indonesia, India, Egypt, Malaysia and Bangladesh.
- The capacity building training programme may have three levels: i) initial level, ii) higher level, and iii) highest level. Initial level programmes may aim imparting all information and knowledge regarding current Population Welfare Programme while higher level programmes may focus on innovations, new ideas and highly professional training in view of what is happening in other developed countries. Also linkages may be established with NGOs and other stakeholders. Highest-level programmes may be research oriented with linkages with NIPS and other research organizations for knowledge sharing and management. At each level there should be some standardized pre training and post training evaluation of trainers.
- An important focus of training should be capacity building of district trainees relating to community mobilization.
- Another aspect of training should be arrangements of training programmes for the non-clinical professional staff of Target Group Institutions.
- Apart from training experts from PWTIs, guest speakers, external resource persons and professionals should be invited to collaborate in training programmes of PWTIs.
- Modern training facilities are not adequately available at PWTIs. These are specialized training institutes and as such these should be fully equipped with most modern training equipments. New building plans for PWTIs are in process. The concerned authorities may expedite their construction.
- Population Welfare Training Institutes should impart training only to the officials of Population Welfare Programme e.g. managers, planners and statisticians etc. and the Master Trainers should conduct training for Drivers, Naib Qasids and Chowkidars.



## REFERENCES

1. Ahmed (1995) "Review of Population Welfare Institute Karachi".
2. Population Council (2000) "Evaluation of Population Welfare Training Institutes".
3. National Institute of Population Studies (2000), "Evaluation of Non-Clinical Training Component of Population Welfare Programme".
4. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Population Welfare Islamabad, "Year Book 2005-2006"
5. Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Population Welfare Islamabad, "PC-1."

## PROJECT STAFF

Project Director:	Mr. Mehboob Sultan
Principal Investigator:	Mrs. Azra Aziz
Field Coordinator:	Mr. Muhammad Anwar Iqbal
Computer Programmer:	Mr. Faateh ud din Ahmad
Computer Operator:	Mr. Muhammad Arshad
Computer Assistant/Typist:	Mr. Imtiaz Hussain Shah

## FIELD STAFF

PUNJAB:	Mr. Muhammad Asif Ali Mr. Muhammad Rafiq Khan Mirani
SINDH:	Mr. Shameem Ahmed Mr. Sikandar Ali Bhatti
NWFP:	Mr. Arif Ali Zadi Mr. Jehanzeb
BALUCHISTAN:	Mr. Sher Muhammad Baloch Mr. Zahoor Ahmed



# ANNEXURE

TABLE 1

NUMBER OF TRAINEES IN EACH TYPE OF TRAINING  
AT PWTI-LAHORE 2002-2005

Technical Type of Training	Participants	Total Attended	% Sample	Sampled
Pre-service Training	DPWO	11		2
	DDPWO	40		8
	Dy. Director	6		1
	Asstt. Director	9		2
	TPWO	52		10
	Dy. Demographer	3		1
	ADPWO	5		1
	MO(Female)	1		0
		<b>127</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>25</b>
Interpersonal Communication	FWA(Male)	75		15
	FWA(Female)	52		10
		<b>127</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>25</b>
Counseling for RH & Skill Development	FWW/FWC	<b>311</b>	<b>10%</b>	<b>31</b>
Monitoring, Supervision & Evaluation	DPWO	4		1
	DDPWO	12		4
	ADPWO	3		1
	Principal	4		1
	Dy. Principal	3		1
	Sn. Instructor	3		1
	Instructor	2		1
	WMO	11		3
	Asstt. Director	2		1
	Director	1		0
	DG(P)	1		0
		<b>46</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>14</b>
Management Information System	Statistical Officer	34		10
	Assistant	14		4
		<b>48</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>14</b>
Presentation Skills	DPWO	3		1
	DDPWO	10		3
	TPWO	3		1
	Asstt. Director	2		1

Technical Type of Training	Participants	Total Attended	% Sample	Sampled
	DD.Admn	1		0
	Director	1		0
		20	30%	6
Training for Master Trainers of Male Mobilizes	DPWO	7		2
	DDPWO	10		3
	TPWO	10		3
	ADPWO	4		1
	Instructor	2		1
		33	30%	10
<b>Management Type of Training</b>				
New Accounting Model	Accountants	15	30%	5
Maintenance of District	Storekeeper	44		9
Warehouse, Contraceptive	UDC	21		4
Logistic System	LDC	10		2
		75	20%	15
Office Management	DPWO	11		2
	DDPWO	17		3
	ADPWO	17		3
	TPWO	3		1
	WMO	8		2
	Superintendent	3		1
	Dy. Director	1		0
	Dy. Secretary	1		0
	Asstt. Director	1		0
	Statistical Officer	1		0
	Artist	1		0
	PS	1		0
		65	20%	13
	Total	867	18	158



**TABLE 2**

**NUMBER OF TRAINEES IN EACH TYPE OF TRAINING  
AT PWTI-KARACHI 2002-2005**

Technical Type of Training	Participants	Total Attended	% Sample	Sampled
Pre-service Training	DPWO	4		1
	DDPWO	14		4
	Asstt. Director	2		1
	Section Officer	3		1
	Dy. Demographer	8		2
	Instructor	5		2
		<b>36</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>11</b>
Interpersonal Communication	FWA(Male)	161		16
	FWA(Female)	68		7
	FWC	44		4
	FWW	66		7
	DPWO	3		0
	TPWO	14		1
	Sister Tutor	3		0
	Instructor	5		1
	SO/RO/TCS	6		1
		<b>370</b>	<b>10%</b>	<b>37</b>
Counseling for RH & Skill Development	FWW/FWC	<b>119</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>24</b>
Computer Literacy	DPWO	13		3
	DDPWO	9		2
	ADPWO	5		1
	TPWO	5		1
	Assistant Director	2		0
	Staff Investigation/supervisor	3		1
	A.O	2		0
	Instructor	5		1
	Accountant	4		1
	Assistant	11		2
	Stenotypist/Stenographer	18		4
	Librarian	2		0
	UDC/LDC	2		0
		<b>81</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>16</b>
Management Information System	DDPWO	2		1
	Statistical Officer	2		1

Technical Type of Training	Participants	Total Attended	% Sample	Sampled
	Assistant	17		5
	Instructor	2		1
		<b>23</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>7</b>
Report Writing Skills	DPWO	8		2
	TPWO	11		3
	Dy. Director	3		1
	Admn. Officer	1		0
		<b>23</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>7</b>
Training for Master Trainers of Male Mobilizes	DPWO	16		5
	DDPWO	10		3
	TPWO	13		4
	ADPWO	4		1
	Instructor RTI	5		1
		<b>48</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>14</b>
Training for Master Trainers on Role of Nazims/Niab Nazam in Promotion of PWP Male Mobilizes	DPWO	16		5
	DDPWO	10		3
	TPWO	3		1
	Dy.D, Demo, A.D, SO, St.O	8		2
		<b>37</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Management Type of Training</b>				
Management of Warehouse & Store	Storekeeper	17		5
	UDC	3		1
	LDC	4		1
		<b>24</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>7</b>
Financial Management	DPWO	8		2
	DDPWO	8		2
	ADPWO	6		1
	TPWO	16		3
	M.O	16		3
	Asstt. Director	5		1
	A.O	4		1
	Accountant	3		1
	Assistant	30		6
	Principal	3		1
	Sr. Instructor	4		1
	Scientific Officer	3		1
		<b>106</b>	<b>20%</b>	<b>21</b>
Strategic Planning and Management	DPWO	18		6



Technical Type of Training	Participants	Total Attended	% Sample	Sampled
	DDPWO	4		1
	TPWO	6		2
	MO	1		0
	Dy. Director	4		1
	Dy. Secretary	1		0
	Asstt. Director	6		2
	Section Officer	2		1
	Principal	1		0
	Instructor	1		0
	DDO	1		0
		<b>45</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>14</b>
Career Management	DPWO	11		3
	ADPWO	7		2
	TPWO	2		1
	Supdt.	2		1
	A.O/Accountant	3		1
	Officers/PWD/MPW	11		3
		<b>36</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>11</b>
Population and Development	DPWO	4		1
	DDPWO	3		1
	TPWO	5		1
	Assistant Director	1		0
	Dy. Director	2		1
	MO	1		0
	Sister Tutor	1		0
		<b>17</b>	<b>30%</b>	<b>5</b>
Family Planning and Office Etiquettes	Driver	84		8
	Naib Qasid	94		9
	Chowkidar	45		4
		<b>223</b>	<b>10%</b>	<b>22</b>
	Total	1188	17	207

TABLE 3

## LIST OF DISTRICTS VISITED DURING THE SURVEY

SN	Punjab District/City	NWFP/AJK District/City	Sindh District/City	Balochistan District/City
1	Khanewal	Peshawar	Karachi	Jaffarabad
2	Sahiwal	Khuram Agency	Badin	Kalat
3	Narowal	Bannu	Hyderabad	Quetta
4	Okara	Dir (upper)	Sanghar	Lasbela
5	Multan	Hango	Jacobabad	Killa Saifullah
6	Muzaffargarh	Swabi	Shikarpur	Killa Kansi
7	Lahore	Mansehra	Ghotki	Chaman
8	Burewala	Nowsehra	Mirpurkhas	Sibi
9	Shakargarh	Charsada	Thatta	Mastung
10	Pasroor	Mardan	Nawabshah	Bolan
11	Alipur	Kohat	Tando Allah Yar	Khuzdar
12	Depalpur	Malakand	Khairpur	Pishin
13	Bhakkar	Tank	Sukkur	Zhob
14	Chak Jhumra	D.I.Khan	Larkana	Ketch
15	Hafizabad	Swat	Dadu	Awaran
16	Layyah	Lower Dir	Tarai	Panjgur
17	Mianwali	Abbottabad	Tharparkar	Kharan
18	R.Y.Khan	Bajur Agency		Dera Bughti
19	T.T.Singh	Malakand Agency		Naseerabad
20	Sialkot	Miran Shah		Loralai
21	Chakwal	Momand Agency		Duki
22	Bahawalpur			
23	Rawalpindi			
24	Jhelum			
25	Shangla			
26	Sheikhupura			
27	Vehari			
28	Jaranwala			
29	D.G.Khan			
30	Rajanpur			
31	Islamabad			
32	Kasur			
33	Gujranwala			
34	Faisalabad			
35	Bahawalnagar			
36	Sargodha			
37	Gujrat			
38	Chunian			
39	Jhang			



TABLE 4

## ASSESSMENT OF TRAINING(s) RECEIVED by PWTI AND PROVINCE

Extent of learning	PWTI-Lahore					PWTI-Karachi			All
	Punjab	NWP	AJK	NA	Total	Sindh	Balochistan	Total	
Not at all	2.2				1.3				0.7
Very little	1.1				0.7	8.0	4.0	6.7	3.6
Little	3.2	8.5			4.6	22.0	6.0	16.7	10.6
To some extent	31.2	10.6			22.4	22.0	20.0	21.3	21.9
Adequate	52.7	27.7	20.0		41.4	42.0	62.0	48.7	45.0
A lot	9.7	53.2	80.0	100.0	29.6	6.0	8.0	6.7	18.2
Percent	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Number	93	47	5	7	152	100	50	150	302

TABLE 5

## ASSESSMENT OF TRAINING(s) RECEIVED BY PWTI'S AND CADR

Extent of learning	Lahore				Karachi				All
	Officers	Supporting staff	Service Providers	Total	Officers	Supporting staff	Service Providers	Total	
Not at all	3.1			1.3					0.7
Very little	1.6			0.7	8.1	4.2	6.3	6.7	3.6
Little	7.8	4.2	1.6	4.6	14.5	16.7	18.8	16.7	10.6
To some extent	15.6	41.7	21.9	22.4	24.2	20.8	18.8	21.3	21.9
Adequate	48.4	33.3	37.5	41.4	45.2	54.2	50.0	48.7	45.0
A lot	23.4	20.8	39.1	29.6	8.1	4.2	6.3	6.7	18.2
Percent	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Number	64	24	64	152	62	24	64	150	302

TABLE 6

## USEFULNESS OF TRAINING(s) BY PWTI AND PROVINCE

		Lahore					Karachi			All
		Punjab	NWFP	AJK	NA	Total	Sindh	Balochistan	Total	
Training was useful for work	Yes	92.5	93.8	100.0	100.0	93.5	97.0	98.0	97.3	95.4
	No	7.5	6.3			6.5	3.0	2.0	2.7	4.6
Training was relevant to work	Yes	93.5	95.8	100.0	100.0	94.8	93.0	98.0	94.7	94.7
	No	6.5	4.2			5.2	7.0	2.0	5.3	5.3
Objectives of the training(s) achieved	Not at all	3.2	2.1			2.6	1.0		.7	1.7
	Very little	8.6	8.3			7.8	14.0	12.0	13.3	10.6
	To some extent	73.1	56.3	20.0	42.9	64.7	69.0	70.0	69.3	67.0
	Fully	15.1	33.3	80.0	57.1	24.8	16.0	18.0	16.7	20.8
	Not at all	2.2				1.3	2.0		1.3	1.3
Training improved/increased understanding of the subject	Little	8.6	8.3			7.8	10.0	16.0	12.0	9.9
	To some extent	75.3	47.9		42.9	62.7	64.0	68.0	65.3	64.0
	Fully	14.0	43.8	100.0	57.1	28.1	24.0	16.0	21.3	24.8
	Not at all	2.2	4.2			2.6	1.0	2.0	1.3	2.0
	Little	10.8	2.1			7.2	14.0	6.0	11.3	9.2
Training helped to enhance abilities to perform duties	To some extent	69.9	50.0	20.0	28.6	60.1	61.0	74.0	65.3	62.7
	Fully	17.2	43.8	80.0	71.4	30.1	24.0	18.0	22.0	26.1
	Not at all	1.1	2.1			1.3				.7
	Little	2.2	2.1			2.0	3.0		2.0	2.0
	To some extent	6.5	16.7		14.3	9.8	2.0	2.0	2.0	6.0
Advise others to attend the similar training	Fully	90.3	79.2	100.0	85.7	86.9	94.9	98.0	96.0	91.4
	Not at all	100.0	100.0		100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Little									
	To some extent									
	Fully									
Training equipped to impart step down training		100.0	100.0		100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Arranged any step-down trainings	Yes	100.0	100.0		50.0	94.7	100.0	100.0	100.0	97.7
	No				50.0	5.3				2.3
Number of trainings arranged	0				50.0	5.3				2.3
	1	20.0	42.9		50.0	31.6	42.9	60.0	50.0	41.9
	2		57.1			21.1	28.6	30.0	29.2	25.6
	3	20.0				10.5	14.3		8.3	9.3
	4	20.0				10.5	7.1		4.2	7.0
	5	20.0				10.5	7.1		4.2	7.0
	6	10.0				5.3				2.3
	8							10.0	4.2	2.3
	20	10.0				5.3				2.3
	Faced any problems to arrange the step-down training	50.0	28.6			36.8	7.1	80.0	37.5	37.2
Total	Yes	50.0	71.4		100.0	63.2	92.9	20.0	62.5	62.8
	No	50.0				36.8	7.1	80.0	37.5	37.2
Total	Percent	100.0	100.0		100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
	Number	10	7		2	19	14	10	24	43



**TABLE 7**  
**USEFULNESS OF TRAINING(s) BY PWTI AND CADER**

		PWTI-Lahore				PWTI-Karachi				All
		Officers	Supporting staff	Service Providers	Total	Officers	Supporting staff	Service Providers	Total	
Training was useful for work	Yes	89.2	95.8	96.9	93.5	95.2	95.8	100.0	97.3	95.4
	No	10.8	4.2	3.1	6.5	4.8	4.2		2.7	4.6
Training was relevant to work	Yes	90.8	95.8	98.4	94.8	90.3	91.7	100.0	94.7	94.7
	No	9.2	4.2	1.6	5.2	9.7	8.3		5.3	5.3
Objectives of the training achieved	Not at all	4.6	4.2		2.6		4.2		.7	1.7
	Very little	9.2	8.3	6.3	7.8	14.5	16.7	10.9	13.3	10.6
	To some extent	69.2	70.8	57.8	64.7	66.1	66.7	73.4	69.3	67.0
	Fully	16.9	16.7	35.9	24.8	19.4	12.5	15.6	16.7	20.8
Training improved/increased understanding of the subject	Not at all	3.1			1.3		8.3		1.3	1.3
	Little	9.2	16.7	3.1	7.8	11.3	8.3	14.1	12.0	9.9
	To some extent	69.2	62.5	56.3	62.7	67.7	66.7	62.5	65.3	64.0
	Fully	18.5	20.8	40.6	28.1	21.0	16.7	23.4	21.3	24.8
Training helped to enhance abilities to perform duties	Not at all	4.6		1.6	2.6	1.6	4.2		1.3	2.0
	Little	10.8	8.3	3.1	7.2	12.9	4.2	12.5	11.3	9.2
	To some extent	60.0	70.8	56.3	60.1	61.3	75.0	65.6	65.3	62.7
	Fully	24.6	20.8	39.1	30.1	24.2	16.7	21.9	22.0	26.1
Advise others to attend the similar training	Not at all	1.5	4.2		1.3					.7
	Little	4.6			2.0	4.9			2.0	2.0
	To some extent	10.8	4.2	10.9	9.8	3.3	4.2		2.0	6.0
	Fully	83.1	91.7	89.1	86.9	91.8	95.8	100.0	96.0	91.4
Training equipped to impart step down training		100.0			100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100	100
Arranged any step-down trainings	Yes	94.7			94.7	100.0			100	97.7
	No	5.3			5.3					2.3
Number of trainings arranged	0	5.3			5.3					2.3
	1	31.6			31.6	50.0			50.0	41.9
	2	21.1			21.1	29.2			29.2	25.6
	3	10.5			10.5	8.3			8.3	9.3
	4	10.5			10.5	4.2			4.2	7.0
	5	10.5			10.5	4.2			4.2	7.0
	6	5.3			5.3					2.3
	8					4.2			4.2	2.3
	20	5.3			5.3					2.3
Faced any problems to arrange the step-down training	Yes	36.8			36.8	37.5			37.5	37.2
	No	63.2			63.2	62.5			62.5	62.8
Total	Percent	100.0			100.0	100.0			100	100
	Number	19			19	24			24	43

Printed By:  
Production & Printing Unit  
Lahore  
Tel/Fax: 042-5757931